Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 International Criminal Court
- 2 Trial Chamber I
- 3 Situation: Darfur, Sudan
- 4 In the case of The Prosecutor v. Ali Muhammad Ali Abd-Al-Rahman
- 5 ("Ali Kushayb") ICC-02/05-01/20
- 6 Presiding Judge Joanna Korner, Judge Reine Alapini-Gansou and
- 7 Judge Althea Violet Alexis-Windsor
- 8 Trial Hearing Courtroom 2
- 9 Thursday, 8 September 2022
- 10 (The hearing starts in open session at 9.31 a.m.)
- 11 THE COURT USHER: [9:31:47] All rise.
- 12 The International Criminal Court is now in session.
- 13 Please be seated.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:32:11] Yes. Good morning, all.
- 15 Could we call the case please.
- 16 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:32:18] Good morning, Madam President. Good
- 17 morning, your Honours.
- 18 This is the situation in Darfur, Sudan, in the case of The Prosecutor versus
- 19 Ali Muhammad Ali Abd-Al-Rahman, case reference ICC-02/05-01/20.
- 20 And for the record, we're in open session.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:32:33] Yes. Thank you very much.
- 22 Yes, appearances.
- 23 Prosecution.
- 24 MR NICHOLLS: [9:32:37] Good morning, your Honour. Good morning everybody
- 25 in the courtroom. Julian Nicholls with Edward Jeremy, Claire Sabatini and

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 Diana Saba. Thank you very much.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:32:49] Representatives for victims.
- 3 MS VON WISTINGHAUSEN: Yes.
- 4 MR NICHOLLS: [9:32:51] And Mohanad Elkholy. I'm sorry, he came in a minute
- 5 late today.
- 6 MS VON WISTINGHAUSEN: [9:32:56] Good morning, Madam President,
- 7 your Honours. Good morning to everyone in and around the courtroom. The
- 8 common Legal Representatives of Victims are represented today by associate counsel
- 9 Anand Shah, case manager Idriss Anbari, and our new legal intern Nur Mahameed.
- 10 And myself, Natalie von Wistinghausen. Thank you.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:33:15] Yes. Thank you, Ms von Wistinghausen.
- 12 And the Defence.
- 13 MR LAUCCI: [9:33:19] Good morning, Madam President. Good morning,
- 14 your Honours. Good morning, colleagues. Good morning, Mr Witness. On
- 15 the side of Mr Ali Muhammad Ali Abd-Al-Rahman present in the courtroom this
- morning, Madam Camille Divet, assistant evidence reviewer; Mr Ahmad Issa, case
- 17 manager, Madam Vanessa Grée; legal assistant; my colleague, Iain Edwards; and
- 18 myself, Cyril Laucci, counsel.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:33:46] Yes. Thank you very much, Mr Laucci.
- 20 Yes. Anything else?
- 21 MR LAUCCI: [9:33:52] Yes, Madam President.
- 22 MR NICHOLLS: [9:33:54] Sorry to interrupt. I'm not sure exactly what my friend is
- 23 going to say. I heard there's a submission. I think perhaps (Overlapping speakers)
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:02] The witness should leave court then
- 25 perhaps.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 MR NICHOLLS: [9:34:07] for the witness, it should perhaps not be in front of the
- 2 witness.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:09] Is it to do with the witness, Mr Laucci?
- 4 MR LAUCCI: [9:34:10] It has to do. I have no problem to do it in front of him.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:14] well, no, I think it is better, if that's -- yes.
- 6 MR NICHOLLS: [9:34:16] Thank you.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:16] Thank you.
- 8 Did you notify the Court that -- that there was going to be a submission this morning?
- 9 Because I wouldn't have had the witness in.
- 10 MR LAUCCI: [9:34:24]I did not. I informed my colleagues, but I did not notify the
- 11 Court. But that -- that will be very short.
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:26] All right. I know. But can you in future,
- 13 Mr Laucci, if you're going to do something like that, tell the Court.
- 14 MR LAUCCI: [9:34:33] I will.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:34:34] Yeah. Thank you.
- 16 Sir, good morning to you. And I'm sorry, I'm afraid we're just going to ask you to
- 17 leave court briefly this morning before you continue with your evidence.
- 18 So the court officer will go with you.
- 19 (The witness exits the courtroom)
- 20 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:35:11] Yes, Mr Laucci, what's the problem?
- 21 MR LAUCCI: [9:35:13] Yes, Madam President. Well, we have been extremely
- 22 patient and quiet yesterday afternoon, but all along his appearance, the -- the witness
- 23 has kept using, well, at least once, derogative word, and especially --
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:35:32] In Arabic, do you mean?
- 25 MR LAUCCI: [9:35:35] Yes. But it was translated. I mean, he used the word

Trial Hearing WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

(Open Session)

ICC-02/05-01/20

- 1 "criminal". It's at page 59, line 6. But throughout there was also repeated body
- 2 language pointing at my client and looking at him. I'm directly in the line of sight.
- 3 I can tell you that this body language was not at all pleasant and I think it's -- it's
- 4 unnecessary.
- 5 It is on record that the witness is identifying our client as Ali Kushayb. There is no
- 6 challenge about that record -- that identification by -- by the witness, but I think for
- 7 good order and for the dignity of these proceedings, the witness should be requested
- 8 to stop, to focus on what he has to say without entering into derogatory language or
- 9 provocative body language as he has done yesterday.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:36:41] I mean, certainly nobody can have failed to
- 11 notice his attitude towards your lay client. I mean, in one sense it could be said
- that's an asset to you, but it -- it's a bit difficult.
- When you say "derogatory language", calling somebody a criminal, obviously that's
- 14 what he says your client is. That is not going to influence us at all. We decide this
- case on the evidence. And so the fact that he uses that word ...
- MR LAUCCI: [9:37:26] My concern, Madam President, is not the impact of this on
- 17 your Honours. My concern is that Mr Ali Muhammad Ali Abd-Al-Rahman is not
- 18 expected to endure that when he is in the courtroom. I mean, it's -- it's -- he is -- he is
- 19 an accused and he appears before this Court. It is not to get insulted or pointed at
- 20 like this. It's, I mean, for -- for question of dignity, I think that is not acceptable.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:37:59] Yes, Mr Nicholls.
- 22 MR NICHOLLS: [9:38:01] Just very briefly, your Honour. I don't think it's unusual
- 23 for a witness in this type of trial, or in a domestic criminal trial, to have --
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:38:11] Mr Laucci, sit down while Mr Nicholls is
- 25 standing up would you. Thank you.

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 MR NICHOLLS: [9:38:17] -- to have those views. I don't believe the term criminal,
- 2 as you said, your Honour, of course it wouldn't affect your Honours and
- 3 it's -- the witness is expressing himself. I think it's natural for a witness to point at
- 4 the accused. He was trying to make sure it was unambiguous who he was referring,
- 5 which my friends have conceded.
- 6 Mr Abd-Al-Rahman may not like it, but he's on trial, and I don't think the witness
- 7 should be instructed at this stage. The witness, to me, has not crossed any lines and
- 8 has pointed at the witness, expressed himself. He's answering the questions as best
- 9 he can, so I don't see a problem here.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:38:57] Yes.
- 11 My reaction is that it's -- it's quite difficult to say to a witness, who hasn't actually
- overstepped the line in the fact that the language he uses is either discriminatory or
- ethnically obnoxious, or whatever. And the fact that he keeps on pointing to your
- client is, as you say, I don't think anybody disputes he recognises, if nothing else, and
- 15 we will be undoubtedly taking that into account from the reports of this trial, if
- 16 nothing else, your client.
- 17 I'll just consult for a moment my colleagues.
- 18 (The Trial Chamber confer)
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:41:11] I think we'll rise in order to -- to discuss this
- 20 properly, because it's a bit difficult when we're all sitting here. In the States I know
- 21 everybody approaches the bench, but we'll rise just to consider this matter, Mr Laucci,
- 22 Mr Edwards.
- 23 THE COURT USHER: [9:41:33] All rise.
- 24 (Recess taken at 9.41 a.m.)
- 25 (Upon resuming in open session at 9.48 a.m.)

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 THE COURT USHER: [9:48:22] All rise.

- 2 Please be seated.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:48:51] Yes.
- 4 Mr Laucci and Mr Nicholls, we've considered this and we are prepared to say a little
- 5 bit to him. Not quite in the terms you've asked for, Mr Laucci, but I think in
- 6 the interests of the smooth continuance of this trial, it would probably help if I -- well,
- 7 it probably won't help at all, but we will see what we can do in respect of, firstly, that
- 8 the speed and the length at which he's answering questions. And we will point out
- 9 to him that although, obviously, he believes he's a criminal, that in the end is a matter
- 10 for us to decide at the end of the case.
- But for future reference, Mr Laucci, this sort of discussion certainly can't be held in
- 12 front of a witness. I know you said that the witness could stay in, but obviously, it
- can't be in front of him.
- 14 MR LAUCCI: [9:50:07] Yes, well noted. And I will provide a notice to the -- to
- 15 the Chamber.
- 16 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:50:13] Yes. Well, let's have the witness back in
- 17 again.
- 18 (The witness enters the courtroom)
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [9:51:27] Sir, I'm sorry that we had to keep you
- 20 waiting. Can I just say a couple of things to you before you continue your evidence.
- 21 You will recall yesterday afternoon you were in the middle, or maybe finished, giving
- 22 a long answer and we broke there with -- you may remember I said to
- 23 Mr Jefferys -- Mr Jeremy that he would need to go back over your very, very long
- 24 answer. And, really, arising from that, can I make a couple of suggestions to you.
- 25 First, that you really listen to the question you're asked and just give an answer to

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

the question. If anybody who's asking you questions wants further details, they'll

- 2 ask for them.
- 3 Second, we all appreciate in this -- in this Court that these events are events which
- 4 obviously cause you to become emotional. I think that's a way of possibly putting it.
- 5 But try not to get too emotional when you recount the events that you are asked about.
- 6 I think it will make it better for the way that your evidence comes across.
- 7 And third, nobody disputes that the man sitting in the dock you've pointed out as
- 8 the man who's Ali Kushayb, so you don't need to keep pointing at him. And you
- 9 called him a criminal. Now, we all understand that that's your strong belief in this
- case, but it's perhaps worth pointing out to you that at the end of the day it's for us,
- the Judges, to decide whether the evidence shows that he is actually a criminal and he
- doesn't legally become a criminal unless and until we convict him of these crimes.
- 13 So I hope that's clear. This is really in an effort to help you, because particularly if
- 14 you keep your answers shorter, you will finish giving your evidence quicker.
- Otherwise, it means if you give these very long answers, that people have to ask
- 16 further questions and go back over them.
- 17 So I hope that's clear to you and I hope that helps you.
- 18 Yes, Mr Jeremy.
- 19 WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878 (On former oath)
- 20 (The witness speaks Arabic)
- 21 THE WITNESS: [9:55:15](Interpretation) Thank you very much, your Honours.
- 22 And I apologise for anything really.
- 23 QUESTIONED BY MR JEREMY: (Continuing)
- 24 Q. [9:55:29] Good morning, sir.
- 25 And good morning, your Honours.

Trial Hearing WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

(Open Session)

- 1 Now, sir, I want to return to the answer that you provided at the end of your
- 2 testimony yesterday afternoon.
- 3 And you'll recall that this was in relation to the arrival by Ahmad Harun and
- 4 a delegation to Mukjar on 9 August 2003.
- 5 So, firstly, sir, in relation to certain locations, so you mentioned you saw
- 6 the helicopter land to the east of the mobile forces garrison. And then you
- 7 mentioned a private meeting took place.
- 8 Now my question, sir, is what was the location of this private meeting? This closed
- 9 meeting I think you referred to.
- 10 A. [9:57:02] Yes. The meeting was held in the meeting room inside
- 11 the municipality.
- 12 Q. [9:57:21] And you mentioned yesterday those persons who were present at the
- 13 meeting, including Ali Kushayb. How were you able to see who attended that
- 14 meeting, sir?
- 15 A. [9:57:51] We were standing under a tree in the municipality. And when
- 16 the delegation arrived from Khartoum and entered the municipality compound, we
- 17 went towards the doors of the municipality building, we were standing there and we
- 18 saw them. They came from behind us and entered the meeting room.
- 19 Q. [9:58:38] And when you saw them, can you estimate how far away you were.
- 20 And as a reminder, the distance between you and I is about 6 metres.
- 21 A. [9:58:58] The distance was not far at all. It wasn't more than 10 metres.
- 22 Q. [9:59:10] Now you said yesterday, sir, that when the persons came out of this
- 23 private meeting, the commander of the Janjaweed addressed the crowds. So my
- 24 question is, who were you referring to when you -- when you referred to
- 25 the commander of the Janjaweed?

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 A. [9:59:51] The commander of the Janjaweed on that day was Ali Kushayb.
- 2 Q. [9:59:59] And when you refer to "crowds", who were you referring to?
- 3 A. [10:00:16] There were no citizens from the area, except us, about nine people, or
- 4 maybe eight people. Everybody else were from the Janjaweed. The Janjaweed and
- 5 their commanders. Obviously, with Ali Kushayb.
- 6 Q. [10:00:40] And do you recall what Ali Kushayb said to these gathered
- 7 Janjaweed?
- 8 A. [10:00:56] He spoke on the behalf of the delegation coming from Khartoum, and
- 9 he said that those men shall be -- shall -- are siding with the government and with
- 10 the armed forces.
- 11 Q. [10:01:25] Now, you also said yesterday that Ahmad Harun addressed
- 12 the crowd. Where were you when these -- when these speeches by Ali Kushayb and
- 13 Ahmad Harun were going on?
- 14 A. [10:01:54] We were as follows: To my right, the delegation from Khartoum.
- 15 Us. And I was there facing the Janjaweed and their leaders, let's say where
- 16 your Honours are sitting. And you have here the commander of the Janjaweed to
- 17 my right as well, facing the crowns.
- 18 Q. [10:02:50] And, sir, you've referred to the Janjaweed leaders, you mentioned
- 19 Ali Kushayb. Do you recall any -- the names of any other Janjaweed leaders present
- at that time?
- 21 A. [10:03:14] One of them was famous and he has cited a long poem in which he
- 22 has lauded the government and its delegation, Al-Dayf Samih Idris. Also another
- one, Muhammad Adam Bonjouse.
- Q. [10:03:57] And do you recall any other persons present from the -- any officials
- 25 based in Mukjar or any other military or other persons present from Mukjar?

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 A. [10:04:27] Regarding the ones that have been present in this meeting between
- 2 the Janjaweed and the government officials, for us citizens we were eight to nine;
- 3 myself, (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted) And I don't remember. Those who I have named were present.
- 6 As for government officials, * there was only the executive director, Khatir Khedher.
- 7 Also one security officer from the region, his name is Isma'il Abd-Al-Karim, from
- 8 security. And another one who was an electrician from the municipality, his name is
- 9 Hussain Adam Nasser.
- 10 Q. [10:06:36] Were any representatives of the -- of the military or
- 11 the Popular Defence Forces present, to your recollection?
- 12 A. [10:06:50] Yes. Within the delegation there was Mr Ali Karti. Ali Karti was
- the general commander of the Popular Defence Forces at that time.
- 14 Q. [10:07:10] Sir, sorry, my question should have been clearer. I meant local
- 15 military or local PDF representatives from either Mukjar or -- or Garsila. We'll come
- 16 back to the delegation shortly.
- 17 A. [10:07:38] From the armed forces there was only Abdullah Himeidan,
- the commander of the garrison of Mukjar, the commander of the military base of
- 19 Mukjar. He was the only one from the armed forces.
- 20 Q. [10:07:59] Okay. Sir, now, yesterday you referred to the members of Harun's
- 21 delegation. You'll recall you listed the six members, you listed three of them by
- 22 name and three by their position. I asked you how you knew who they were and
- 23 you -- you provided a thorough answer and I know you were about to address that
- 24 exact point. But if I could ask you to do that now, to explain how was it you knew

25 who those people were.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 A. [10:08:45] Okay. Do you mean from the armed forces or all the members of

- 2 the delegation?
- 3 Q. [10:08:56] Sir, you -- you listed the six members of the delegation. And my
- 4 question, just -- and I hope you'll be able to answer it in brief terms, is just how did
- 5 you know who those people were? How is it that you were able to name them or
- 6 indicate their position? So did you already know them or -- or was their identity
- 7 brought to your attention in some other way?
- 8 A. [10:09:31] Okay. Regarding Mr Ahmad Harun, he was the interior minister.
- 9 He was well known by all Sudanese, or the majority.
- 10 Mr Ali Karti, who was the general commander of the PDF and he became later on
- the minister of foreign affairs, he was also very well known to all Sudanese.
- 12 As for the others, Major General Suleiman Abdullah, he is the governor of the state of
- 13 West Darfur. At that time we used to know him very well.
- 14 As for the members of the armed forces, Mr Ahmad Harun addressed them, saying
- 15 that this is the director of the western command and this is the director -- the director
- of the security in the state of South Darfur, and this is the director of the police in
- 17 the state of West Darfur. So he introduced them.
- 18 Q. [10:11:10] Now, you also said yesterday that Ahmad Harun made a speech. So
- 19 after the arrival of the helicopter and the private meeting, the public meeting where
- 20 Ali Kushayb addressed the Janjaweed, you then said that Ahmad Harun made
- 21 a speech.
- Now, following Ahmad Harun's speech, did any other members of the delegation
- 23 also make a speech?
- 24 A. [10:11:49] Yes. After the speech of Mr Ahmad Harun, the interior minister,
- 25 Ali Karti took the floor. Ali Karti, the commander of the Popular Defence Forces,

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

ICC-02/05-01/20

- and he said to the Janjaweed and their leaders, "You, today, are considered a part of
- 2 the PDF. You are a part of the PDF. We will train you. We will give you weapons.
- 3 We will give you wages. And we will provide assistance to your people."
- 4 He donated 10,000 Sudanese dinars at that time, so 10,000 dinars. And he said, "I
- 5 will give you 5,000 in cash today and 5,000 when the helicopter would come back."
- 6 Q. [10:13:15] Now, sir, was there any reaction from the crowd in response to either
- 7 Ahmad Harun's speech or Ali Karti's speech?
- 8 A. [10:13:38] They repeated "Allahu Akbar. Down with the traitors." This is what
- 9 the Janjaweed said.
- 10 As for us, the ones standing there, we were confused as to the new hat given to these
- 11 Janjaweed when they have become governmental forces, despite the fact that the State
- 12 has its own army, its own police, and its own armed forces that would defend its
- 13 property. And those are tribes.
- 14 Q. [10:14:41] And did any of the group that you were with say anything in
- 15 response to either of those speeches? Did they address Ahmad Harun or Ali Karti?
- 16 A. [10:14:55] Yes. There has been reaction * from Uncle Suleiman Musa the tailor,
- 17 Wad Telin Telin. At that time, the Janjaweed were looting the property of citizens
- and the minister was watching that and the minister told them, "Please stop those
- 19 people who are looting the houses and property of citizens." And the answer came
- 20 from Ahmad Harun. He was angry and he told them, "Like bring the property of
- 21 the State, give it to your children and then we'll be providing your food."
- 22 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:16:14] Sorry, do you mean (Overlapping
- 23 speakers)
- 24 THE INTERPRETER: [10:16:17] They gave us back the things, the property of our
- 25 children.

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:16:23] Do you mean the looting had already

- 2 started when the speeches were being made?
- 3 THE WITNESS: [10:16:39](Interpretation) The looting started on August 15 when
- 4 the Janjaweed entered into Mukjar while they were headed to the -- to
- 5 the neighbourhood * where the garrison was and they have started looting the area
- 6 west to the municipality.
- 7 And this looting has continued until Saturday, so they were looting the houses.
- 8 MR JEREMY: [10:17:16]
- 9 Q. [10:17:16] Sir, just -- just a clarification on dates. So you said that this meeting
- 10 took place on 9 August. So had the looting begun before -- before the date of this
- 11 event in Mukjar?
- 12 A. [10:17:44] Yes, the looting started when the vehicles arrived and when there was
- a green light given to those to enter the garrison. While they were entering
- 14 the command, they were looting the houses. This was on August 8 when they have
- 15 entered the command.
- 16 Q. [10:18:19] Thank you. I just wanted to clarify that because
- 17 the -- the interpretation said August 15, but as I understand it it was August 8 that
- the Janjaweed arrived and the looting began; is that right?
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:18:33] It's not what the interpreter said, it's
- whether or not that's what he said.
- 21 MR JEREMY: [10:18:40]
- Q. [10:18:40] Is that what you said, sir, that be the Janjaweed arrived on 8 August,
- 23 not the 15th?
- 24 A. [10:18:47] The looting started on August 8 when the Janjaweed arrived through
- 25 Mukjar and reached the command south to Mukjar. All the western part of the city

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 has been looted.

- 2 Q. [10:19:15] I also want to clarify one of your earlier answers in relation to -- to
- 3 the looting. You -- you said, transcript page 15, line 10, that the minister told them,
- 4 "Please stop those people who are looting the houses and property of the citizens."
- 5 Is that correct, sir?
- 6 A. [10:19:56] No. The answer of the minister was as follows: "If you would like
- 7 to leave the Janjaweed, take your property and your food from your own houses.
- 8 You have to give them back -- to give back the property of the State that has been
- 9 looted by your own children", i.e., the Sudan Liberation Movement when they left
- 10 Mukjar on 8/8. This was the reaction or the answer of the minister. He said that if
- 11 you don't give back the property you will be looted, you will be killed, you will be
- 12 raped. This is what he said.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:20:54] Well, yes, but -- sorry, who was the one
- 14 who said to the minister -- which person said to the minister, "Please stop
- 15 the looting"?
- 16 THE WITNESS: [10:21:15](Interpretation) Citizen Suleiman Musa, * the tailor, aka
- 17 Wad Telin, while the minister was watching with his own eyes the Janjaweed
- looting the houses and taking the property of citizens on back of their camels and
- 19 donkeys.
- 20 MR JEREMY: [10:21:44]
- 21 Q. [10:21:44] Now, sir, after -- after these speeches by Ahmad Harun and Ali Karti
- 22 ended, did the delegation stay in Mukjar or did it leave?
- 23 A. [10:22:07] No, the delegation has left Mukjar upon the end of the two meetings.
- 24 The speech delivered by the first delegation and the second meeting with
- 25 the governor of Mukjar and the head of the local administration of Mukjar. So they

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 left to Khartoum.

2 Q. [10:22:41] And after the delegation left, sir, did Ali Kushayb and his forces

(Open Session)

- 3 remain in Mukjar or did they leave?
- 4 A. [10:23:01] Yes, exactly. After an hour and a half, or two hours after
- 5 the helicopter left Mukjar, Ali Kushayb and his forces started to attack the villages
- 6 east and north of Mukjar on Saturday, August 9, till Thursday, August 14, 2003.
- 7 And they have burned nine villages. They burned down nine villages.
- 8 If you would like to know, I can give you the names of those villages. Like in two
- 9 hours only, or one hour 30 minutes after the delegation left.
- 10 Q. [10:24:09] Yes, if you could -- if you could tell us which villages were -- you're
- 11 referring to, please.
- 12 A. [10:24:21] * The villages east of Mukjar were: first, Arada, second, Siggir, third,
- 13 Indri, fourth, Balbaso, fifth, Dimbukabdé, sixth, Tendy, seventh, Aberla, eighth,
- 14 Segaderra, and ninth, Aberla.
- 15 Q. [10:25:02] And, sir, how do you know that these villages were attacked by
- 16 Ali Kushayb and his forces?
- 17 A. [10:25:26] Since August 8, until Thursday, August 14, 2003, we were watching,
- * knowing that three or four people from the command that have been beaten,
- 19 the houses have been burned down. But we wanted to be aware of the news and
- 20 receive the news any time so we would know about what was happening from
- 21 the people who would flee from those villages to Mukjar.
- We had with us as well some security officers from the region, Mr Abd-Al-Karim who
- 23 was responsible for the security services, and because at that time the communication
- 24 was really bad.
- 25 And those Janjaweed did not return to Mukjar until Thursday, August 14. Those

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 people, those Janjaweed came back with their leaders and we had also waves of

- 2 Janjaweed who would come to Mukjar and to follow the ones that were burning
- 3 the villages.
- 4 Q. [10:27:05] And how do you know that the Janjaweed returned on -- on the 14th?
- 5 Could you -- were you able to see them? Did others tell you that they had returned?
- 6 How did you know?
- 7 A. [10:27:25] They brought with them large cattle, cows, sheep, and you could hear
- 8 them, because they were really in huge numbers. So you would hear those cattle
- 9 even while you are at your home in Mukjar.
- 10 Q. [10:27:51] And where were they located? Were they -- were they inside of
- 11 Mukjar town or outside, if you know?
- 12 A. [10:28:04] No, they have been to the north-western side. You know there, there
- is a plain where they have arrived with their cattle, and the ones leading the cattle
- 14 were behind the mounted Janjaweed. Those who were riding horses were
- 15 the closest to the village.
- 16 MR JEREMY: [10:28:44] Madam President, I'm moving to my next topic,
- 17 which -- which unfortunately is going to require private session. I don't think there's
- any way around it. My apologies to those in the gallery. It's --
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:28:59] Is that the topic on page 21?
- 20 MR JEREMY: [10:29:03] Exactly.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:29:04] Yeah. All right.
- 22 Yes. Private session, I'm afraid. How long do you think? I mean it's not easy to --
- 23 MR JEREMY: [10:29:14] It's going to take us to the break, at least.
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [10:29:17] To the break. Yes, all right.
- 25 Private session, please. Just so the public gallery understand, that means you won't

Trial Hearing DAR-OTP-P-0892 (Open Session)

ICC-02/05-01/20

- 1 be hearing anything before the break.
- 2 (Private session at 10.29 a.m.)
- 3 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:29:37] We're in private session, Madam President.
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Page redacted – Private session
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
-	
20	
20 21	
202122	
20 21	
202122	

(Open Session)

Trial Hearing DAR-OTP-P-0892

25

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Page redacted – Private session
13 14	Page redacted – Private session
	Page redacted – Private session
14	Page redacted – Private session
14 15	Page redacted – Private session
14 15 16	Page redacted – Private session
14151617	Page redacted – Private session
1415161718	Page redacted – Private session
141516171819	Page redacted – Private session
14151617181920	Page redacted – Private session
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page redacted – Private session
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page redacted – Private session

(Open Session)

Trial Hearing DAR-OTP-P-0892

25

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Page redacted – Private session
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
-	
20	
20 21	
202122	
20 21	
202122	

(Open Session)

Trial Hearing DAR-OTP-P-0892

25

(Open Session)

Trial Hearing

DAR-OTP-P-0892

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Upon resuming in open session at 11.47 a.m.)
- 9 THE COURT USHER: [11:47:39] All rise.
- 10 Please be seated.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:47:56] Just before we carry on. And this needn't
- 12 be translated for the witness. I'll deal at the end of the day with the situation in
- 13 P-1018, but, Mr Jeremy, how much longer are you going to be in chief?
- 14 MR JEREMY: [11:48:17] I expect I'll finish before the end of the day, but -- but part
- 15 way through the final session.
- 16 Having -- having spoken to Mr Edwards, who can speak for himself --
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:48:33] It's Mr Edwards cross-examining is it?
- 18 Right.
- 19 MR JEREMY: [11:48:37] I understand that that will still leave sufficient time for -- for
- 20 him.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:48:41] That is sufficient. That gives you
- 22 tomorrow.
- 23 MR EDWARDS: [11:48:45] If I can -- if I can start fresh tomorrow morning, I have no
- 24 hesitation in saying that I'll be finished well before the end of the day.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:48:55] Well, that's what -- that's what I was

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

becoming concerned about. But if you're sure about that, Mr Edwards.

- 2 MR EDWARDS: [11:49:02] It's actually -- I'll say no more, but, yes.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:49:07] No. All right.
- 4 Yes. Yes, thank you.
- 5 It's because Mr Shah didn't ask my questions last time, Ms von Wistinghausen.
- 6 Ms von Wistinghausen, do you know how long you're going to be.
- 7 MS VON WISTINGHAUSEN: [11:49:24] I don't know exactly. I mean the more I
- 8 think about it, the more questions I have. But, of course, I will take the time and the
- 9 timing into consideration. So I hope I can squeeze this in today.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:49:37] Well, yeah. All right.
- 11 Mr Jeremy, I think you are going to have to * finish in time for the -- today for
- 12 the representative of the victims to ask their questions.
- 13 MR JEREMY: [11:49:49] I will do so, Madam President.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:49:50] Right.
- 15 So, Ms von Wistinghausen, if you're given 45 minutes, will -- will that cover it?
- 16 MS VON WISTINGHAUSEN: [11:49:55] That's I think more than enough. I would
- 17 think 20 to 30 minutes, something. And it also depends on -- on the responses
- the witness will give to Mr Jeremy's questions.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:50:06] Okay. All right.
- 20 Sir, can we now -- sorry, can we resume the translation.
- 21 Sir, what we've been discussing is the timing, and it's obviously important that you
- 22 finish your evidence tomorrow.
- 23 Can I urge you again, as I did this morning, please, to keep your answers short and
- simply to answer the question that you're asked with a "yes" or "no", if possible. If
- 25 not, just the question that's asked. And as I say, if -- if any of the lawyers want more

Trial Hearing (Private Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

details, I have no doubt they can ask you follow-up questions. But it's really point,

- 2 from your point of view, that -- that you're able to finish your evidence. Which is, as
- 3 you'll realise, important, by tomorrow.
- 4 Yes, Mr Jeremy.
- 5 MR JEREMY: [11:51:10] Thank you, Madam President, your Honours.
- 6 To resume the questioning we'll need to go back into private session, I'm afraid.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:51:18] Right. How much longer do you think
- 8 we need to be in private for?
- 9 MR JEREMY: [11:51:22] Regretfully, I think it's going to be --
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:51:25] Most of the day.
- 11 MR JEREMY: [11:51:26] -- most of the day. Yeah.
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [11:51:28] Yeah. All right.
- 13 Private session, please.
- 14 (Private session at 11.51 a.m.)
- 15 THE COURT OFFICER: [11:51:39] We're in private session, Madam President.
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Upon resuming in open session at 2.17 p.m.)
- 9 THE COURT USHER: [14:17:43] All rise.
- 10 Please be seated.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [14:18:17] Yes, Mr Jeremy, whenever you're ready.
- 12 MR JEREMY: [14:18:22] Thank you, Madam President, your Honours. And just
- 13 to --
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [14:18:28] We're in open session, I gather. It's still
- 15 private, is it?
- 16 MR JEREMY: [14:18:34] Yes, please.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [14:18:37] Yes.
- 18 Private session then, please.
- 19 (Private session at 2.18 p.m.)
- 20 THE COURT OFFICER: [14:18:42] We're in private session, Madam President.
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Open session at 3.42 p.m.)
- 6 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:42:52] We're in open session, Madam President.
- 7 QUESTIONED BY MS VON WISTINGHAUSEN:
- 8 Q. [15:43:00] Good afternoon, Mr Witness. My name is Natalie von
- 9 Wistinghausen. We haven't had the opportunity to meet yet, but you've met my
- 10 colleague. And both of us, together with our team, we represent the victims who are
- 11 participating in these proceedings. And I have a few questions to ask you.
- 12 First of all, you will have realised that we are now in a public session. I think it's
- important that at least parts of your testimony are heard by the public. Obviously,
- 14 nobody can see your face. However, that means that you have to be cautious. I
- 15 think you can answer the questions in public, but just be reminded not to mention
- 16 your name, names of your family members, the village where you come from and
- 17 the work you were doing. Is that all right for you?
- 18 A. [15:44:02] Yes, of course.
- 19 Q. [15:44:07] We understand from your testimony yesterday that based on your
- 20 work and please don't mention it you were familiar with different villages in
- 21 the areas of Bindisi and Mukjar; is that correct?
- 22 A. [15:44:31] Yes, that is accurate.
- 23 Q. [15:44:35] Can you tell us what were the main livelihoods of the Fur people
- 24 living in these villages? What did they live off?
- 25 A. [15:45:00] Their main source of revenue for those people was linked to

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

agriculture as a first element, if you will. And also they raised cattle, second element.

- 2 And they also made cheese.
- 3 Q. [15:45:29] And if people in your community had money, or jewellery, or gold,
- 4 would they normally store this wealth in their homes?
- 5 A. [15:45:47] Yes, indeed they would keep this at their homes.
- 6 Q. [15:45:58] And can you tell us, gold or jewellery jewellery, difficult word for
- 7 me do they have any cultural significance for the Fur people, for the people in your
- 8 community?
- 9 A. [15:46:22] Gold, gold is the -- is the most important thing for women to dress up.
- 10 And that's true in every community. And the more gold a woman puts on, the more
- it shows how well off and affluent she is. And that is why they care to keep gold.
- 12 Q. [15:47:05] I would like to ask you about the treatment of civilians after the rebel
- 13 attack on Mukjar on 8 August 2003. Remember that yesterday you told us that
- 14 following the rebel attack on Mukjar on 8 August, "any man who would be found
- would be arrested and be beaten." And I'm quoting from the transcript: "... all
- the men were taken to the command forces so that they are insulted and beaten and
- 17 arrested." Right, this is what you said yesterday.
- 18 Can you tell us what were the tribes or ethnicities of the men who were arrested and
- 19 abused by the mobile forces?
- 20 A. [15:48:16] You're asking about those detained, or the -- or the ethnicity of those
- 21 who carried out the attack?
- 22 The ethnicity of the forces, or the ethnicity of the tribes whose citizens got arrested,
- 23 which one?
- Q. [15:48:34] Those who were arrested and abused by the mobile forces?
- 25 A. [15:48:46] After the battle between the two sides ended, the mobile -- the mobile

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 forces entered every house -- raided every house in Mukjar and arrested most of

- 2 the men, except the men who had managed to leave. Their own colleagues in
- 3 the Mukjar police station were arrested. A person, if arrested, he would have his
- 4 robe put on his head and his head would be covered by his own robe and would be
- 5 beaten and put in the command office. Every man ended up in that office. They
- 6 were all beaten up, humiliated, and some of them even got injured. Some got
- 7 injured on their backs because of these heavy knives they used. And the injuries
- 8 were filled with a nylon -- a nylon bag that was put in a format that allowed it to drip
- 9 on those injuries.
- 10 As to the town of Mukjar, it was surrounded by a circle of Janjaweed troops. No one
- 11 can escape. No one could escape, nor could anyone enter. At least it was difficult
- 12 to enter town. It was a very difficult situation, and for about two months not
- 13 a single commercial vehicle or a vehicle carrying supplies or food was able to enter.
- 14 All the villages where there were food supplies got burned. Even salt, a typically
- 15 very cheap product, was lost. And the container where salt would be prepared,
- those containers were destroyed so that the salt becomes no longer available. And it
- shows how much evil-hearted, bitter and resentful these were towards the locals.
- 18 So some villages were burned, and in some other villages were -- that were not
- 19 burned, the bags of that -- where crops were were burned. So there was no way for
- 20 us to go to these villages to get food for ourselves. And it was raining. For eight
- 21 days it was raining continuously. There was no sun, and there was no way to sleep
- 22 on a proper mattress, or to cover yourself, or to have access to food or to medication.
- 23 This is how the situation was like. These poor people were in such circumstances.
- Q. [15:52:37] I was going to ask -- I was going to ask you about the burning of
- 25 the crops. Can you make it clear for us again why the crops were burnt. In your

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 handwritten statement you speak about the burning of corn, if I'm not mistaken.

- 2 A. [15:53:05] What is very deplorable is that after targeting individuals per se, and
- 3 targeting their honour and assets, food in and of itself became a weapon in order to
- 4 prevent people from living or from benefiting from these supplies. Each time after
- 5 burning a village they would go back to the village and, should there be any crop
- 6 bags left still unburned, they would rip that off using knives, and using other sharp
- 7 tools, so that rain may pour on those crops and they would hence become useless and
- 8 no one could really use them, by anyone. So that's how they used food and water as
- 9 weapons.
- 10 Q. [15:54:12] Thank you. I would like to ask you about the immediate impact of
- 11 the events on your community. And obviously you've already talked about this
- today, but just a few more concrete questions.
- 13 The people of the burned villages, and you spoke about many villages that were
- burned, had to flee. Can you tell us where they moved to and approximately how
- many they were. And can you also tell us if we're talking about men, women and
- 16 children.
- 17 A. [15:55:13] Most of the citizens in the villages around Mukjar and Bindisi, most of
- the citizens got displaced to Mukjar. Their number was approximately 60,000 people.
- 19 Some of them fled to the Republic of Chad (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted) Back then it was the fall season
- 21 and those who left the country did so after October. But back in August, it was not
- 22 possible for anyone to leave the region because it was encircled by Janjaweed troops
- 23 so that the people would die out of hunger and out of the targeting by weapons.
- 24 By October a large number of elderly people, pregnant women, and children died out
- of hunger and disease. If you go to the -- to a cemetery to bury someone, you would

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

(Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

- be unable to come back because the number of dead people would be coming in
- 2 droves. You would go and you would find other folks burying their own dead. It
- 3 continued like that for a long time.
- 4 Q. [15:57:21] I may be asking the obvious, and allow me to lead on this. But you
- 5 have described a lot of houses that you yourself saw burning and where nothing was
- 6 left. Can I assume that this means that there was nothing left in the houses, no
- furniture, no jewels, no food, no animals, if there were any? Are we really speaking
- 8 about houses that burnt to the ground? And please only refer to what you have seen
- 9 with your own eyes. Thank you.
- 10 A. [15:58:09] These Janjaweed, some of them knew citizens very well. They knew
- 11 who was rich and who was not. They knew their homes and their shops and they
- 12 also knew who had a -- a lot of livestock and a lot of cattle. When they came to
- 13 attack a village, they would race -- they would compete to get to the house of
- 14 the person who was financially doing well. They would first loot all that was inside
- 15 the house, then they would burn the house. As to the other houses which they
- deemed worthless, they would just set on fire and didn't bother to loot. So they left
- 17 nothing standing. That which is neither burned nor looted, they endeavoured to
- destroy it, to make sure it becomes useless, it becomes of no worth to whomsoever.
- 19 That was the operation that the Janjaweed carried out.
- 20 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [15:59:34] Yes, well, the interpreters have been
- 21 working a long time today, this afternoon. So I think we'll call a halt there.
- 22 Sir, we're being to have to call a halt to your evidence for today. You will resume
- 23 tomorrow morning at 9.30. But you'll be concluded tomorrow. Thank you very
- 24 much.
- 25 THE WITNESS: [16:00:02](Interpretation) God willing. Thank you very much.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

1 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:00:04] Yes. If you'd like to leave with

- 2 the court officer, please.
- 3 (The witness exits the courtroom)
- 4 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:00:40] Yes. Just very quickly, I gather very
- 5 helpfully that both sides have reached an agreement on P-1018. In order -- can I
- 6 understand what -- do you admit -- sorry, Mr Laucci, or Mr Edwards, whoever dealt
- 7 with this, do we understand that you admit the contents of the document and that
- 8 they are -- they comply with all the evidentiary rules on documents?
- 9 MR LAUCCI: [16:01:15] The documents that have been submitted are only lists of
- identified victims, and this is not something that we intend to challenge.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:01:26] Right. Thank you very much, indeed.
- 12 The only thing then, they've got to comply with the code of conduct and they've got
- to list the contents and all the rest of it.
- 14 MR NICHOLLS: [16:01:37] Thank you, your Honour. We will make that
- 15 (Overlapping speakers)
- 16 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:01:40](Overlapping speakers)
- 17 MR NICHOLLS: [16:01:40] I just wanted to and thank you again to my friend get
- this on the table quickly as the witness was scheduled as the next witness.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:01:48] Yes. No. Well, the Chamber is happy
- 20 that, and subject to the usual formalities being complied with, those documents will
- 21 be admitted as -- as a bar table motion, I suppose, really.
- 22 And the one thing I should say, Mr Jeremy, having if not overtly, impliedly criticised
- 23 you for taking too long over this, that was -- the document that you compiled from
- 24 what, I'm afraid to say, the Chamber had given up trying to read the notes, really was
- 25 extremely helpful. And I recommend that if there are future witnesses where we

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-02/05-01/20

WITNESS: DAR-OTP-P-0878

- 1 have the same, either interviews with Arabic interspersed in the middle, or notes, that
- 2 the same procedure is followed.
- 3 MR JEREMY: [16:02:40] Thank you, Madam President. And I credit my colleague
- 4 Ms Saba for that document.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE KORNER: [16:02:45] Right. Well, whoever -- whoever did this
- 6 document gets the credit. Very helpful, indeed.
- 7 Yes, thank you. 9.30, please.
- 8 THE COURT USHER: [16:02:57] All rise.
- 9 (The hearing ends in open session at 4.02 p.m.)