Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 International Criminal Court
- 2 Trial Chamber X
- 3 Situation: Republic of Mali
- 4 In the case of The Prosecutor v. Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed
- 5 Ag Mahmoud ICC-01/12-01/18
- 6 Presiding Judge Antoine Kesia-Mbe Mindua, Judge Tomoko Akane and
- 7 Judge Kimberly Prost
- 8 Trial Hearing Courtroom 3
- 9 Wednesday, 2 November 2022
- 10 (The hearing starts in open session at 9.47 a.m.)
- 11 THE COURT USHER: [9:47:09] All rise.
- 12 The International Criminal Court is now in session.
- 13 Please be seated.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:47:38](Interpretation) Court is in session.
- 15 Good morning to everyone in the courtroom.
- 16 Court officer, please could the call the case.
- 17 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:47:49] Good morning, Mr President, your Honours.
- 18 This is the situation in the Republic of Mali, in the case of The Prosecutor versus
- 19 Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud, case reference
- 20 ICC-01/12-01/18.
- 21 And for the record, we are in open session.
- 22 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:48:09](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 23 court officer.
- We are going to start with the appearances. First of all, the Office of the Prosecutor.
- 25 MR ALLAFI: [9:48:23](Interpretation) Good morning, your Honour, your Honours.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 The Office of the Prosecutor today is composed of Lucio Garcia, Gilles Dutertre and
- 2 myself, Mousa Allafi. Thank you very much.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:48:39](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 4 Prosecutor.
- 5 I turn to the Defence. *Maître*.
- 6 MS TAYLOR: [9:48:48] Good morning, Mr President. Good morning
- 7 your Honours. Good morning to everyone inside and around the courtroom. The
- 8 Defence for Mr Al Hassan is represented today by *Maître* Melissa Beaulieu Lussier, by
- 9 Mr Maouloud Al-Ansary and myself, Melinda Taylor. And Mr Al Hassan is
- 10 attending and is behind us. Thank you very much.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:49:12](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 12 Ms Taylor.
- 13 I also take this opportunity to greet Mr Al Hassan.
- 14 I now turn to the Legal Representatives for the Victims.
- 15 Counsel.
- 16 MR LUVENGIKA: [9:49:23](Interpretation) Good morning, your Honour,
- 17 your Honours. The victims are represented by Romane Tovia Vila and myself,
- 18 *Maître* Fidel Nsita Luvengika. Thank you.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:49:41](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 20 Maître Nsita.
- 21 I now turn towards the witness. I would recall that we are now doing Witness
- 22 D-0243 of the Defence.
- 23 Good morning, Witness, can you hear me?
- 24 WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243
- 25 (The witness speaks Tamasheq)

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 (The witness gives evidence via video link)
- 2 THE WITNESS: [9:50:03](Interpretation) I can hear you and I also greet you in the
- 3 courtroom.
- 4 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:50:17](Interpretation) Thank you, Witness.
- 5 On behalf of the Chamber I would like to welcome you.
- 6 THE WITNESS: [9:50:31](Interpretation) God, thank you.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:50:34](Interpretation) You are going to testify
- 8 with a view to aiding the Chamber to establish the truth in the case concerning
- 9 Mr Al Hassan.
- 10 THE WITNESS: [9:50:58](Interpretation) God willing.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:51:01](Interpretation) Witness, protective
- measures have been put into place such that your identity is not revealed to the
- 13 public.
- 14 THE WITNESS: [9:51:23](Interpretation) Very well.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:51:27](Interpretation) Whenever you have to give
- details which could reveal your identity, we will speak about them in private session.
- 17 As such, nobody outside the people present in this courtroom will be able to hear
- 18 you.
- 19 THE WITNESS: [9:52:05](Interpretation) Very well.
- 20 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:52:10](Interpretation) Witness, I'm now going to
- 21 proceed with your solemn undertaking under Rule 66(1) of the Rules of Procedure
- 22 and Evidence.
- 23 THE WITNESS: [9:52:46](Interpretation) Very well.
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:52:48](Interpretation) It is the solemn undertaking
- according to which you have to swear to tell the truth, the whole truth, so I would ask

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 you to repeat after me the formula that I'm now going to speak.
- 2 I solemnly declare that I will tell the truth.
- 3 THE WITNESS: [9:53:41](Interpretation) Very well.
- 4 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:53:42](Interpretation) No, please repeat after me.
- 5 I solemnly declare that I will tell the truth.
- 6 THE WITNESS: [9:53:54](Interpretation) I solemnly declare that I will tell the truth.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:54:08](Interpretation) The whole truth and
- 8 nothing but the truth.
- 9 THE WITNESS: [9:54:27] (No interpretation)
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:54:30](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 11 Mr Witness. Now you are under oath.
- Representatives of the VWU as well as the Defence representatives will already have
- 13 explained to you what that means.
- 14 So I therefore have certain issues of a practical nature for you.
- 15 THE WITNESS: [9:55:24](Interpretation) Very well.
- 16 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:55:25](Interpretation) You have to mind in mind
- 17 throughout your testimony that everything that is said in this courtroom is
- 18 transcribed by court reporters and it is simultaneously interpreted -- and
- 19 consecutively interpreted into different languages by interpreters.
- 20 THE WITNESS: [9:56:03](Interpretation) Very well.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:56:05](Interpretation) It's therefore important to
- 22 speak clearly and slowly. Do not start speaking until the person who has put
- 23 a question to you has finished putting that question.
- 24 So, first of all, you will be questioned by the Defence. Thereafter, you will have
- 25 cross-examination from the Office of the Prosecutor. And then there will be

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 questions by the representative of victims and perhaps by the Chamber as well.
- 2 THE WITNESS: [9:57:31](Interpretation) Very well.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:57:33](Interpretation) So without further ado, I
- 4 pass the floor to the Defence for the start of the examination-in-chief.
- 5 Ms Taylor.
- 6 MS TAYLOR: [9:57:42] Thank you very much, Mr President.
- 7 QUESTIONED BY MS TAYLOR:
- 8 Q. [9:57:47] Good morning, Mr Witness. How are you today?
- 9 A. [9:58:01] I'm fine. Thank you.
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [9:58:02] Mr President, with your leave, may we go into private
- session to ask questions of an identifying nature?
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:58:17](Interpretation) Indeed, Ms Taylor.
- 13 Court officer, please take us into private session.
- 14 (Private session at 9.58 a.m.)
- 15 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:58:33] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Open session at 10.00 a.m.)
- 7 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:00:38] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:00:42](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 9 Madam Court Officer.
- 10 Ms Taylor.
- 11 MS TAYLOR: [10:00:50]
- 12 Q. [10:00:51] Mr Witness, do you have a binder of documents next to you? There
- should be a couple of Defence documents.
- 14 I'm going to be referring to the first document, it's tab 1, MLI-D28-0006-9053, and that
- can be shown on the screens but not to the public.
- Now, Mr Witness, can you see a mark at the left-hand side of the bottom of the page?
- 17 A. [10:01:59] Yes.
- 18 Q. [10:02:00] Mr Witness, did you make that mark?
- 19 A. [10:02:14] Yes, I did.
- 20 Q. [10:02:18] Now, Mr Witness, could you just quickly look on each page and
- 21 confirm if you can see the mark on each page, the same mark?
- 22 A. [10:03:05] Yes, indeed. That's my signature. I'm the person who put it on
- 23 there.
- Q. [10:03:16] So thank you, Mr Witness. So do you confirm that you put your
- 25 signature on each page of this document?

Trial Hearing (Private Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 A. [10:03:39] Exactly.
- 2 Q. [10:03:42] Now, Mr Witness, do you recall a week ago that this statement was
- 3 read out to you in Tamasheq?
- 4 A. [10:04:07] Yes, exactly.
- 5 Q. [10:04:10] I'm going to be referring to another document, it's Defence tab 4. It's
- 6 MLI-D28-0006-9090, and again, it should not be shown to the public.
- 7 And, Mr President, with your leave, I believe it will be necessary for me to read out
- 8 these corrections in private session.
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:04:38](Interpretation) Court officer, please take
- 10 us into private session.
- 11 (Private session at 10.04 a.m.)
- 12 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:04:50] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243 1 (Redacted) 2 (Redacted) 3 (Redacted) 4 (Redacted) 5 (Redacted) 6 (Redacted) (Redacted) 7 8 (Redacted) 9 (Redacted) 10 (Redacted) 11 (Redacted) 12 (Redacted) (Redacted) 13 14 (Redacted) 15 (Redacted) 16 (Redacted) 17 (Redacted) 18 (Redacted) 19 (Redacted) 20 (Redacted) 21 (Open session at 10.20 a.m.) 22 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:20:27] We are back in open session, Mr President. 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:20:33](Interpretation) Thank you very much. 24 Maître Taylor.

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

25

MS TAYLOR: [10:20:38]

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 Q. [10:20:38] Now, Mr Witness, either before or during your interviews with the
- 2 Defence, did anyone ask you to give evidence to this Court that was not true?
- 3 A. [10:21:23] No.
- 4 Q. [10:21:25] Did anyone promise you anything in exchange for giving evidence to
- 5 the Court?
- 6 A. [10:21:51] No.
- 7 Q. [10:21:54] Did anyone pressure you or force you to sign the statement you saw
- 8 today?
- 9 A. [10:22:23] No.
- 10 Q. [10:22:26] And before signing your statement, did you discuss the content of
- 11 your evidence with anyone outside of the Defence?
- 12 A. [10:23:00] No.
- Q. [10:23:04] Now, Mr Witness, you have the statement in front of you and we have
- 14 gone through the corrections. Do you consent for your statement with these
- 15 corrections to be submitted into evidence?
- 16 A. [10:23:58] Yes, I accept.
- 17 MS TAYLOR: [10:24:04] Mr President, I have two more documents to show. May I
- do so in private session as they are identifying?
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:24:14](Interpretation) Yes, indeed.
- 20 Court officer, private session, please.
- 21 (Private session at 10.24 a.m.)
- 22 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:24:32] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18 WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Open session at 10.57 a.m.)
- 16 THE COURT OFFICER: [10:57:12] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:57:19](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 18 Prosecutor.
- 19 MR ALLAFI: [10:57:28](Interpretation) Thank you, your Honour.
- 20 Q. [10:57:31] Witness, in the region of Timbuktu, the family relationship is
- 21 important, is it not?
- 22 A. [10:57:56] Indeed it is.
- Q. [10:58:00] I would be right to say, would I not, that the -- I would be right to say,
- 24 would I not, that solidarity within a tribe is important, is it not?
- 25 A. [10:58:36] With good intentions, yes.

Trial Hearing WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [10:58:41] And you would agree with me that in your tribe, Kel Ansar, it's
- 2 traditional to learn the Koran, isn't it?
- 3 A. [10:59:05] Indeed.
- 4 Q. [10:59:08] And, Witness, we are in agreement that in your tribe, it is the person
- 5 who knows the Koran -- that if a person knows the Koran well, they can teach that to
- 6 their children, when they have a certain level of education, can they not?
- 7 A. [10:59:55] What is common is that we take teachers for children from other
- 8 side -- from other tribes, teachers from other tribes to teach the children.
- 9 Q. [11:00:19] But in your tribe, Kel Ansar, you have members who taught the Koran,
- 10 didn't they?
- 11 A. [11:00:36] Yes, indeed.
- 12 MR ALLAFI: [11:00:39](Interpretation) Your Honour, I will -- I tried to make it -- I
- tried to avoid private session but we'll have to go into private session.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [11:00:53](Interpretation) Court officer, please take
- 15 us into private session.
- 16 (Private session at 11.01 a.m.)
- 17 THE COURT OFFICER: [11:00:58] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243 1 (Redacted) 2 (Redacted) 3 (Redacted) 4 (Redacted) 5 (Redacted) 6 (Redacted) (Redacted) 7 8 (Redacted) 9 (Redacted) 10 (Redacted) 11 (Redacted) 12 (Redacted) (Redacted) 13 14 (Redacted) 15 (Redacted) 16 (Redacted) 17 (Redacted) 18 (Redacted) 19 (Redacted) 20 (Redacted) 21 (Redacted) 22 (Redacted) 23 (Open session at 12.27 p.m.) 24 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:27:31] We are in open session, Mr President.

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

25

02.11.2022 Page 35

PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:27:35](Interpretation) Thank you very much,

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 court officer.
- 2 Prosecutor.
- 3 MR ALLAFI: [12:27:42](Interpretation) Your Honour, I think that there was
- 4 a misunderstanding with regards to my question, so I'm going to repeat it.
- 5 Q. [12:27:52] Witness, I'm not speaking about the news that Al Hassan had been
- 6 sent to the Court. My question was that once Al Hassan, your friend with whom
- 7 you had spent time, when he had been sent to the International Criminal Court,
- 8 did -- you had news from him, did you not? Or news of him?
- 9 THE INTERPRETER: [12:28:40] Corrects the interpreter.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:28:51] Maître Taylor.
- 11 MS TAYLOR: [12:28:53] Thank you, Mr President. I do believe it's the same
- 12 question.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:29:04](No interpretation)
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [12:29:04] I do believe the Prosecutor has put the same question to the
- 15 witness. It might be that they didn't intend to, but as it comes across, it is the same
- 16 question, and it will be interpreted as such.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:29:25](Interpretation) Very well. Perhaps the
- 18 witness hasn't understood.
- 19 Let's listen to the answer.
- 20 Interpreter, I think the witness already replied. Could you translate, please.
- 21 Very well. Prosecutor restart.
- 22 THE WITNESS: [12:29:43](Interpretation) I didn't understand the question.
- 23 MR ALLAFI: [12:29:49](Interpretation)
- 24 Q. [12:29:49] Witness, once Mr Al Hassan was here in The Hague at the
- 25 International Criminal Court, did you have news from him or about him?

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:30:21](Interpretation) Please wait for the answer,

- 2 Ms Taylor.
- 3 THE WITNESS: [12:30:28](Interpretation) What type -- I don't understand the
- 4 question. I don't understand the question.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [12:30:37] Mr President? If I may?
- 6 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:30:40](No interpretation)
- 7 MS TAYLOR: [12:30:41] The Prosecutor has put a question with two compound
- 8 possibilities in the question. If they are going to put this to the witness, they should
- 9 put it very clearly. If the question is whether they heard news -- whether this person
- 10 received information directly from Mr Al Hassan, that is the question that should be
- 11 put to the witness. If they are going to ask a very general question as to whether he
- 12 had heard news about Mr Al Hassan, that's already been answered.
- 13 I also suggest this should be in private session, given that if they are going to drill
- down on this, this will give details that will identify the witness. Thank you.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:31:24](Interpretation) Prosecutor, have you
- 16 heard? The Defence says that there are two possibilities for your question. So
- 17 which do you choose? Because it also depends on whether we should stay in open
- 18 session or in private session.
- 19 MR ALLAFI: [12:31:41](Interpretation) I think we can stay in open session firstly.
- 20 Secondly, I will choose my question such that it's very clear.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:31:52](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 22 Please go ahead.
- 23 MR ALLAFI: [12:31:56](Interpretation)
- Q. [12:31:56] Witness, when Mr Al Hassan was sent to the ICC -- to the
- 25 International Criminal Court and there was a case for which you are testifying today,

Trial Hearing
WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Open Session)

did you ask him about his news or did you ask about his news, from his family, for

- 2 example?
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:32:29](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [12:32:32] Thank you, Mr President. Again it's a compound question.
- 5 The Prosecutor should put each possibility separately to the witness so we don't get
- 6 confusion. They should go through it in very clear stages because we repeatedly
- 7 have the witness say he doesn't understand the question, and again the Prosecutor
- 8 has put a compound question with two separate possibilities in it.
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:33:00](Interpretation) Prosecutor, I admit that
- 10 the witness could understand your question. But let's apply the rule and let's not
- 11 have compound questions. Just ask a question and then a second one.
- 12 MR ALLAFI: [12:33:18](Interpretation)
- 13 Q. [12:33:20] Witness, is it correct that you asked news about Al Hassan from his
- 14 family? That you asked for news -- Al Hassan's family -- from -- you asked for news
- about Al Hassan from his family?
- 16 A. [12:34:00] No.
- 17 Q. [12:34:09] You say no. So it's the friend with whom you spent a lot of time, he
- has an international case in a foreign country and you don't ask the family for news
- 19 about him. Is that your testimony, Witness?
- 20 A. [12:35:13] In fact, the information is very clear, the information that I received is
- 21 very clear. It was on the news. It was on the radio, on television. And these news
- 22 were international, we got this news without needing a third party -- without the
- 23 agreement of a third party.
- 24 MR ALLAFI: [12:35:44](Interpretation) Your Honour, I have two private session
- 25 questions. It's very important.

Trial Hearing WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:35:50](Interpretation) Court officer, please take
- 2 us into private session.
- 3 MR ALLAFI: [12:35:54](Interpretation) I would state that the Office of the
- 4 Prosecutor has made an effort and I will finish very soon.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:36:01](Interpretation) That's very good news.
- 6 (Private session at 12.36 p.m.)
- 7 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:36:21] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Open session at 12.41 p.m.)
- 14 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:41:46] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:41:51](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 16 court officer.
- 17 Prosecutor.
- 18 MR ALLAFI: [12:41:59](Interpretation)
- 19 Q. [12:42:02] Yes, thank you, your Honour.
- 20 Witness, was it you who contacted the Defence or was it the Defence who contacted
- 21 you the first time?
- 22 A. [12:42:41] They called me the first time.
- 23 Q. [12:42:49] Who called you?
- 24 A. [12:43:03] It was the person who acts as the intermediary between them and
- 25 myself.

Trial Hearing (Open Session) ICC-01/12-01/18

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 Q. [12:43:13] And who is this person?
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:43:18](Interpretation) Please wait, Prosecutor.
- 3 Perhaps it's a sensitive matter.
- 4 Ms Taylor.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [12:43:22] Yes, Mr President. As the Prosecution is well aware, this is
- 6 information that is covered by redactions which they are now attempting to elicit in
- 7 a way that is entirely inappropriate, particularly that they're doing so in open session.
- 8 This is information that has been withheld from the Prosecution through redactions.
- 9 It's not appropriate for them to try and evade those redactions through questioning
- 10 the witness, particularly given that it could impact upon the security of this
- 11 individual. Thank you.
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:43:54](Interpretation) Indeed, Ms Taylor. You
- 13 say that the name was redacted. Now the Prosecutor would like to know. I think
- 14 we can say it in private session. Would you agree with that?
- 15 MS TAYLOR: [12:44:09] Mr President, no we would not agree with it, because that
- 16 would defeat the purpose of the redactions, in that the purpose of the redactions is to
- 17 withhold the information. So this information has consistently been withheld for
- 18 security reasons. But this issue has come up earlier and the Judges upheld the fact
- 19 that it should not be disclosed and that questioning should not be a way to evade
- 20 redactions, in the same way that the Defence cannot seek to question a witness about
- 21 information that's covered by redactions. Otherwise, it defeats the whole purpose of
- 22 redactions. Thank you.
- 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:44:54](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I'm astonished,
- 24 because the Chamber hasn't ruled on the redaction. So how did you arrange that it
- 25 be redacted for the Chamber and for the Office of the Prosecutor?

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

1 MS TAYLOR: [12:45:12] Thank you, Mr President. This has been the subject of

- 2 prior exchanges with the Prosecution. It did go to the Chamber and the Chamber
- 3 did uphold the redactions on that instance. I also recall it arising in an earlier
- 4 witness and, again, the Chamber overruled the Prosecution's attempt to elicit this
- 5 information.
- 6 Now, the same information has been redacted from Prosecution statements.
- 7 We were not allowed to have access to it. The question is, do Defence redactions
- 8 have the same legal force as Prosecution redactions, and I would hope that they
- 9 would. Now, this is an individual who is -- the Defence depends on him, we will
- 10 continue to depend on him till the end of this case. We do not believe that he should
- be put at risk by his name being put into the record and by questions being put about
- 12 him. The Prosecution has the information, they have the information that it was
- 13 a Defence intermediary. They don't need the name of the individual unless they
- 14 provide a specific foundation for that.
- 15 Mr President, I do recall that in line with the past practice that was adopted by the
- 16 Chamber, the Prosecution can put questions about the type of information the
- 17 intermediary elicited. They can put questions about whether any inappropriate
- 18 questioning was put to the witness. All of that can be done without actually eliciting
- 19 the name of the individual. Thank you.
- 20 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:46:37](Interpretation) I can see the Prosecutor on
- 21 his feet.
- 22 Mr Prosecutor.
- 23 MR ALLAFI: [12:46:43](Interpretation) Yes, Mr President, your Honours, that is
- 24 strange. I didn't understand the argument of the Defence. It is very, very
- 25 important and pertinent. And when it comes to private sessions, security is no

Trial Hearing WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- longer an issue, Mr President. There is no reason for the OTP not to ask that
- 2 question. If that is linked to security, you ask the questions to the Prosecution
- 3 witnesses that were more important than that, and the Chamber allowed those
- 4 questions to be put to the witnesses. So I really do not understand.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:47:46](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I think there is
- 6 a little confusion. There is the issue of the redaction itself and then there is the issue
- 7 of the relevance of the information itself.
- 8 Now, regarding the relevance, the Office of the Prosecutor believes that there is
- 9 a reason for that and we will get to know about that shortly.
- 10 Now, regarding the principle of redaction itself, we have the rules, as I was saying
- 11 this morning. In certain cases, the provider of information can request that such
- information should not be disclosed to one party or the other, and the Chamber
- 13 accepts that, because information can come from an individual or even from a state.
- 14 That happens.
- 15 Secondly, when it relates to the problem of the security of the witness, for example,
- the Chamber itself can order redaction or authorise redaction up to a deadline before
- 17 we go into open session. But here we are in private session and you said that this
- 18 was subject to a redaction order. My colleagues are not aware, me neither.
- 19 We were actually in open session, so we will go into private session. The
- 20 Prosecution will put the question and there is no problem of security.
- 21 Do you agree, Ms Taylor?
- 22 MS TAYLOR: [12:49:42] Thank you, Mr President. Respectfully, no, we do not
- 23 agree. The Prosecution intermediaries were consistently redacted from statements
- 24 from the Defence. If the Prosecution wished to obtain this information in advance of
- 25 the witness's testimony, they could have filed an application to the Chamber to obtain

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

1 the information covered by the redaction. They did not do so. They're now

- 2 attempting to do so through questioning rather than litigation.
- 3 Now, in the past, the Prosecution has attempted to have access to this information,
- 4 and the Chamber has rejected it as being unfounded, as being a fishing expedition,
- 5 a phrase that I think the Chamber has used quite often in response to Defence
- 6 requests for the equivalent information. If the Prosecution wishes to have this
- 7 information, there needs to be much more of a foundation rather than simply, "We
- 8 want it", which appears to be the case. So if they substantiate a very concrete reason
- 9 to have access to the information, they could have done so through a written
- 10 application. Otherwise, this is simply a fishing expedition. Thank you.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:50:44](Interpretation) Very well.
- 12 So, Ms Taylor, according to you, there was a protocol agreement between you and the
- 13 OTP regarding this redaction?
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [12:51:10] If I can refer the Chamber to -- I believe it's T-181, 7 June
- 15 2022. There was an oral ruling to this effect by the Chamber on this very same
- 16 question. This falls within the fourth corner of that same oral ruling.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:51:40](Interpretation) I can see the Prosecutor on
- 18 his feet.
- 19 MR ALLAFI: [12:51:43](Interpretation) Yes, Mr President. With witness
- 20 MLI-D28-0006-9053, first page, there is a redaction, 1, location, and 2, something else.
- 21 There is nowhere that there are redactions on intermediaries, so we cannot ask the
- 22 Defence to lift the redaction because there were no redactions on intermediaries. So
- 23 the line of questioning is relevant and can be very useful for the witnesses that will
- 24 come up later. So there is no security issue also in private session.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:52:43](Interpretation) Very well.

Trial Hearing WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Ms Taylor, you still want to take the floor? The Chamber needs to be clarified.
- 2 MS TAYLOR: [12:52:51] Mr President, the redactions on the cover page concern
- 3 court interpreters only and locations. We could lift it and provide it to the Chamber,
- 4 but the redactions on this page exclusively concern court interpreters.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:53:13](Interpretation) Very well. Thank you
- 6 very much.
- 7 (Trial Chamber confer)
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:54:00](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, for the reasons
- 9 that I have already explained, the Chamber finds that there are no grounds for
- 10 redaction at this particular time when we are in session. We are going to order
- a private session and the Prosecutor will put his question.
- 12 Court officer, private session, please.
- 13 (Private session at 12.54 p.m.)
- 14 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:54:34] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

Page 46

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243 1 (Redacted) 2 (Redacted) 3 (Redacted) 4 (Redacted) 5 (Redacted) 6 (Redacted) (Redacted) 7 8 (Redacted) 9 (Redacted) 10 (Redacted) 11 (Redacted) 12 (Redacted) (Redacted) 13 14 (Redacted) 15 (Redacted) 16 (Redacted) 17 (Redacted) 18 (Redacted) 19 (Redacted) 20 (Redacted) 21 (Redacted) 22 (Redacted) 23 (Open session at 12.59 p.m.)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

24

25

02.11.2022

PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:00:03](Interpretation) Thank you very much,

THE COURT OFFICER: [12:59:56] We are back in open session, Mr President.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 court officer.
- 2 Mr Prosecutor.
- 3 MR ALLAFI: [13:00:10](Interpretation) Thank you, Mr President.
- 4 Q. [13:00:14] Mr Witness, after reading through your statement, and listening
- 5 keenly to your answer, the reality, Mr Witness, is that you came here today to testify
- 6 before this Court simply in favour of your inseparable friend; isn't that correct,
- 7 Mr Witness? And that your inseparable friend is the accused.
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:00:55](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 9 MS TAYLOR: [13:00:56] One, we are in open session.
- 10 Two, again there was a compound question there. I'm not sure if the question -- if
- the witness is being asked about his relationship to the individual or why he's
- testifying, but there's two separate possibilities in one question.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:01:20](Interpretation) No, Ms Taylor, I'm not
- 14 with you there. I think I shouldn't even give the floor to the Prosecutor to react.
- 15 The question is sufficiently clear.
- Mr Witness, we are in open session. If you feel that there is a need to go to private
- session, please let us know, but I think that that question can be answered in open
- 18 session.
- 19 THE WITNESS: [13:02:45](Interpretation) I took an oath to tell the truth and I came
- 20 to the court of justice today, I did not come here for Al Hassan.
- 21 MR ALLAFI: [13:03:03](Interpretation)
- 22 Q. [13:03:04] Thank you very much, Mr Witness.
- 23 Mr President, I have no further questions.
- 24 Thank you for your time.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:03:14](Interpretation) Thank you very much,

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

- 1 Mr Prosecutor.
- 2 I would like to congratulate you for your efficiency and your conciseness.
- 3 Now, I turn to the Legal Representatives of the Victims.
- 4 We still have about 13 minutes. Do you have any questions to put to the witness or
- 5 not?
- 6 *Maître* Nsita, you have the floor.
- 7 MR LUVENGIKA: [13:03:46](Interpretation) Yes, I thank you, Mr President, for
- 8 giving me the floor, but having listened attentively to the testimony of this witness,
- 9 the Legal Representatives of Victims do not have any questions for him. Thank you.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:04:04](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 11 Maître Nsita.
- 12 We still have 11 minutes. Now I turn towards the Defence to find out whether you
- 13 have any redirect, Ms Taylor.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [13:04:21] Thank you, Mr President. We don't have any further
- 15 questions. I believe when I thanked the witness earlier for testifying, it wasn't
- interpreted, so I just ask that that be interpreted now.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:04:41](Interpretation) Thank you, Ms Taylor.
- 18 I'm waiting for the interpretation to go to the witness.
- 19 THE WITNESS: [13:04:58](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 20 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:05:03](Interpretation) Thank you once again,
- 21 Ms Taylor.
- 22 Mr Witness, once more I would like to address you. On behalf of the Chamber, I
- 23 would want to express our gratitude to you once again for assisting us by answering
- very generously and very kindly all the questions that were put to you.
- 25 Your testimony has now come to an end.

Trial Hearing (Open Session)

WITNESS: MLI-D28-P-0243

1 I wish you great success for your future and a lot of luck. And, once again, thank

- 2 you very much for your cooperation.
- 3 THE WITNESS: [13:06:38](Interpretation) For my part, I would like to thank
- 4 everyone. I would like to thank all those who are present there, all those who put
- 5 questions to me, and also all those who answered my questions.
- 6 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:06:54](Interpretation) You're welcome,
- 7 Mr Witness. Thank you very much.
- 8 (The witness is excused)
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:06:55] Now, for the parties and the participants,
- we will resume tomorrow at 09.45 and we will hear the testimony of Witness D-0093.
- 11 Is that correct, Ms Taylor?
- 12 MS TAYLOR: [13:07:21] Yes, Mr President.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [13:07:27](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 14 Ms Taylor.
- 15 Before we adjourn, as usual, I would like to very sincerely thank all the parties and
- participants, the court reporters and the interpreters, the security officers, as well as
- 17 the members of the public in the gallery and outside of the court premises. I wish
- 18 everyone a very good day, and see you tomorrow.
- 19 Court is adjourned.
- 20 THE COURT USHER: All rise.
- 21 (The hearing ends in open session at 1.08 p.m.)