Cour Pénale Internationale



International Criminal Court

Original: English

No.: ICC-01/18

Date: 16 March 2020

# PRE-TRIAL CHAMBER I

Before: Judge Péter Kovács, Presiding Judge

Judge Marc Perrin de Brichambaut

Judge Reine Adélaïde Sophie Alapini-Gansou

### SITUATION IN THE STATE OF PALESTINE

### **Public**

#### **ANNEX**

Amicus Curiae Observations of Prof. Laurie Blank, Dr. Matthijs de Blois, Prof. Geoffrey Corn, Dr. Daphné Richemond-Barak, Prof. Gregory Rose, Prof. Robbie Sabel, Prof. Gil Troy and Mr. Andrew Tucker

Source: Prof. Laurie Blank,

Dr. Matthijs de Blois, Prof. Geoffrey Corn,

Dr. Daphné Richemond-Barak,

Prof. Gregory Rose, Prof. Robbie Sabel, Prof. Gil Troy

Mr. Andrew Tucker

# **ANNEX TO**

Amicus Curiae Observations of Prof. Laurie Blank, Dr. Matthijs de Blois, Prof. Geoffrey Corn, Dr. Daphné Richemond-Barak, Prof. Gregory Rose, Prof. Robbie Sabel, Prof. Gil Troy and Mr. Andrew Tucker

# LIST OF AUTHORITIES

(Listed in order of first appearance)

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
1.	Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Germain Katanga against the Oral Decision of Trial Chamber II of 12 June 2009 on the Admissibility of the Case, Appeals Chamber, ICC-01/04-01/07 OA 8, 25 September 2009 <a href="https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2009_06998.PDF">https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2009_06998.PDF</a>	2, 103
2.	Decision on the "Prosecution's Request for a Ruling on Jurisdiction under Article 19(3) of the Statute", Pre-Trial Chamber I, ICC-RoC46(3)-01/18, 6 September 2018  https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2018_04203.PDF  Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Perrin de Brichambaut  https://www.icc-cpi.int/RelatedRecords/CR2018_04205.PDF	2, 12, 14, 18, 20, 103
3.	Decision Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute on the Charges of the Prosecutor Against Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, Pre-Trial Chamber II, ICC-01/05-01/08-424, 15 June 2009 <a href="https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2009_04528.PDF">https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2009_04528.PDF</a>	3
4.	Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America), Merits, Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 1986, p. 14 <a href="https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/70/judgments">https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/70/judgments</a>	3
5.	Legality of the Use by a State of Nuclear Weapons in Armed Conflict, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 1996, p. 66 <a href="https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/93/advisory-opinions">https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/93/advisory-opinions</a>	5, 15
6.	Decision Pursuant to Article 15 of the Rome Statute on the Authorisation of an Investigation into the Situation in the People's Republic of Bangladesh/Republic of the Union of Myanmar, Pre-Trial Chamber III, ICC-01/19, 14 November 2019 <a href="https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2019_06955.PDF">https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2019_06955.PDF</a>	6

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
7.	Lionel Yee, "The International Criminal Court and the Security Council: Articles 13(b) and 16", in Roy S.K. Lee ed., <i>The International Criminal Court: The Making of the Rome Statute</i> (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1999) 146	7, 8
	(Excerpt attached)	
8.	Luigi Condorelli and Santiago Villalpando, "Referral and Deferral by the Security Council", in Antonio Cassese et al. eds., <i>The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court: A Commentary</i> (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002) 627	7, 8
	(Excerpt attached)	
9.	Judgment in the Jordan Referral re Al-Bashir Appeal, Appeals Chamber, ICC-02/05-01/09 OA2, 6 May 2019	10
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2019_02593.PDF	
10.	Decision on the Prosecutor's request for authorization of an investigation, Pre- Trial Chamber I, ICC-01/15, 27 January 2016	13, 50, 51, 102,
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2016_00608.PDF	
	Separate Opinion of Judge Péter Kovács	
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/RelatedRecords/CR2016_00627.PDF	
11.	Decision on the Prosecutor's Application that the Pre-Trial Chamber disregard as irrelevant the Submission filed by the Registry on 5 December 2005, Pre-Trial Chamber II, ICC-02/04-01/05, 9 March 2006	14
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2007_02854.PDF	
12.	Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Georgia v. Russian Federation), Preliminary Objections, Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 2011, p. 70	15
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/140/judgments	
13.	Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (New Application: 2002) (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Rwanda), Jurisdiction and Admissibility, Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 2006, p. 6	15
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/126/judgments	
14.	Request for an Examination of the Situation in Accordance with Paragraph 63 of the Court's Judgment of 20 December 1974 in the Nuclear Tests (New Zealand v. France) Case, I.C.J. Reports 1995, p. 288	15
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/97/orders	
15.	In the Matter of the Chagos Marine Protected Area Arbitration (Mauritius v. United Kingdom), Permanent Court of Arbitration, Award, 18 March 2015  https://www.pcacases.com/pcadocs/MU-UK%2020150318%20Award.pdf	16
	https://www.pcacases.com/pcadocs/MU-UK%2020150318%20Award.pdf	

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
16.	Legal Consequences of the Separation of the Chagos Archipelago from Mauritius in 1965, Advisory Opinion, International Court of Justice, 25 February 2019	17, 63
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/169/advisory-opinions	
17.	Accordance with International Law of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence in Respect of Kosovo, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 2010, p. 403	19
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/141/advisory-opinions	
18.	Declaration of Principles on Interim Self-Government Arrangements, 13 September 1993	21
	https://peacemaker.un.org/israelopt-osloaccord93	
19.	Israeli-Palestinian Interim Agreement on the West Bank and the Gaza Strip, 28 September 1995	22
	https://peacemaker.un.org/israelopt-osloII95	
20.	Island of Palmas (Netherlands v. USA), 4 April 1928, 2 R.I.A.A. 829	28
	https://legal.un.org/riaa/cases/vol_II/829-871.pdf	
21.	Legal Status of Eastern Greenland (Denmark v. Norway), 1933 P.C.I.J. (ser. A/B) No. 53 (Apr. 5)	28
	http://www.worldcourts.com/pcij/eng/decisions/1933.04.05_greenland.htm	
22.	Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia), Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 2002, p. 625	28
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/102/judgments	
23.	James Crawford ed., <i>Brownlie's Principles of International Law</i> , 8 <sup>th</sup> ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012)	28
	(Excerpt attached)	
24.	Office of the Attorney-General, State of Israel, "The International Criminal Court's lack of jurisdiction over the so-called 'situation in Palestine'" (20 December 2019)	29
	https://mfa.gov.il/MFA/PressRoom/2019/Documents/ICCs%20lack%20of%20 jurisdiction%20over%20so- called%20%E2%80%9Csituation%20in%20Palestine%E2%80%9D%20-%20 AG.pdf	
2.5		20 11 51
25.	Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 2004, p. 136	30, 41, 64, 65, 66, 78
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/131/advisory-opinions	
	Separate Opinion of Judge Kooijmans	

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
	https://www.icj-cij.org/files/case-related/131/131-20040709-ADV-01-03-EN.pdf	
26.	Case of the Monetary Gold Removed from Rome in 1943 (Preliminary Question), Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 1954, p. 19 <a href="https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/19/judgments">https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/19/judgments</a>	31
27.	East Timor (Portugal v. Australia), Judgment, I.C.J. Reports 1995, p. 90 <a href="https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/84/judgments">https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/84/judgments</a>	31, 33
28.	South China Sea Arbitration (Philippines v. China), Award, P.C.A. Case No. 2013-19 <a href="https://pcacases.com/web/sendAttach/2579">https://pcacases.com/web/sendAttach/2579</a>	31
29.	UNSC Res. 1397, 12 March 2002, UN Doc. S/RES/1397 <a href="http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/1397">http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/1397</a>	35
30.	UNSC Res. 1515, 19 November 2003, UN Doc. S/RES/1515 <a href="http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/1515">http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/1515</a>	36
31.	US State Department, Bureau of Public Affairs, Roadmap for Peace in the Middle East: Israeli/Palestinian Reciprocal Action, Quartet Support, 16 July 2003 <a href="https://2001-2009.state.gov/r/pa/ei/rls/22520.htm">https://2001-2009.state.gov/r/pa/ei/rls/22520.htm</a>	37
32.	UNSC Res. 2334, 23 December 2016, UN Doc. S/RES/2334 <a href="http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/2334">http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/2334</a>	38
33.	UNGA Res. 67/19, 29 November 2012, UN Doc. A/RES/67/19 <a href="https://undocs.org/A/RES/67/19">https://undocs.org/A/RES/67/19</a>	39, 74
34.	UNGA, Official Records: 67th session, 44th plenary meeting, 29 November 2012, UN Doc. A/67/PV.44 <a href="https://undocs.org/en/A/67/PV.44">https://undocs.org/en/A/67/PV.44</a>	40, 74
35.	Convention on the Conservation and Management of Highly Migratory Fish Stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean, 5 September 2000, 2275 U.N.T.S. 43 <a href="https://www.wcpfc.int/doc/convention-conservation-and-management-highly-migratory-fish-stocks-western-and-central-pacific">https://www.wcpfc.int/doc/convention-conservation-and-management-highly-migratory-fish-stocks-western-and-central-pacific</a>	46
36.	Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission, Arrangement for the Participation of Fishing Entities (5 September 2000) <a href="https://www.wepfc.int/doc/arrangement-participation-fishing-entities">https://www.wepfc.int/doc/arrangement-participation-fishing-entities</a>	47

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
37.	International Convention for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas, 14 May 1966, 673 U.N.T.S. 63	48
	https://treaties.un.org/doc/Publication/UNTS/Volume%20673/volume-673-I-9587-English.pdf	
38.	International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas, <i>Becoming a Member</i>	49
	https://www.iccat.int/en/membership.html	
39.	Decision on the Prosecutor's "Request for an order directing the Registrar to transmit the request for arrest and surrender to Mr al-'Ajami AL-'ATIRI, Commander of the Abu-Bakr Al Siddiq Battalion in Zintan, Libya", Pre-Trial Chamber I, ICC-01/11-01/11, 21 November 2016	51
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2016_25280.PDF	
40.	Office of the Prosecutor, Report on Preliminary Examination Activities 2016 (14 November 2016)	52
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/iccdocs/otp/161114-otp-rep-PE_ENG.pdf	
41.	United Nations Secretary-General, Note to correspondents - Accession of Palestine to multilateral treaties, 7 January 2015	54
	https://www.un.org/unispal/document/auto-insert-205168/	
42.	United Nations Office of Legal Affairs, Issues related to General Assembly resolution 67/19 on the status of Palestine in the United Nations, 21 December 2012	56
	http://palestineun.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/08/012-UN-Memo-regarding-67-19.pdf	
43.	United Nations Office of Legal Affairs, Summary of Practice of the Secretary-General as Depositary of Multilateral Treaties, 1999, UN Doc. ST/LEG/7/Rev.1	57
	https://treaties.un.org/doc/source/publications/practice/summary_english.pdf	
44.	James Crawford, "The Creation of the State of Palestine: Too Much Too Soon?" (1990) 1 Eur. J. Int'l. L. 307	58
	(Article attached)	
45.	Malcolm N. Shaw, <i>International Law</i> , 6 <sup>th</sup> ed. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008)	59, 67, 68, 69
	(Excerpt attached)	
46.	Klinghoffer v. SNC Achille Lauro, 937 F.2d 44 (1992)	60
	https://law.justia.com/cases/federal/district-courts/FSupp/795/112/2596348/	
47.	Jeremie Bracka, "No "State"-ing the Obvious for Palestine: Challenging the ICC Prosecutor on Territorial Jurisdiction" <i>Just Security</i> (27 February 2020)	62

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
	https://www.justsecurity.org/68841/no-state-ing-the-obvious-for-palestine-challenging-the-icc-prosecutor-on-territorial-jurisdiction/	
48.	Deutsche Continental Gas-Gesellschaft v. Polish State, Germano-Polish Mixed Arbitral Tribunal, 5 I.L.R. 11, 1 August 1929	68, 69
	(Case attached)	
49.	James Crawford, <i>The Creation of States in International Law</i> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006)	70
	(Excerpt attached)	
50.	Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 1996, p. 226	72
	https://www.icj-cij.org/en/case/95/advisory-opinions	
51.	Office of the Prosecutor, Situation in Palestine (3 April 2012)	75
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/NR/rdonlyres/C6162BBF-FEB9-4FAF-AFA9-836106D2694A/284387/SituationinPalestine030412ENG.pdf	
52.	"L'indépendance du Kosovo ne viole pas le droit international" <i>Le Monde</i> (22 July 2010)	77
	https://www.lemonde.fr/europe/article/2010/07/22/la-cour-internationale-dejustice-valide-l-independance-du-kosovo_1391186_3214.html	
53.	Malcolm N. Shaw, "Territorial Administration by Non-territorial Sovereigns" in Broude and Shany eds., <i>The Shifting Allocation of Authority in International Law</i> (Oxford: Hart Publishing, 2008) 369	79
	(Article attached)	
54.	United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg, <i>The Justice Trial (Trial of Josef Altstötter and Others)</i> , Case No. 35, 4 December 1947, in UN War Crimes Commission, <i>Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals</i> , vol. VI (London: His Majesty's Stationery Office, 1948) 1	79
	(Case attached)	
55.	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 16 December 1966, 999 U.N.T.S. 171	80
	https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/ccpr.aspx	
56.	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 16 December 1966, 993 U.N.T.S. 3	80
	https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cescr.aspx	
57.	Ariel Zemach, "Assessing the Scope of the Palestinian Territorial Entitlement" (2019) 42(4) Fordham Int'l. L.J. 1203	81
	(Article attached)	

S/N	Description	Footnote No.
58.	UNSC Res. 242, 22 November 1967, UN Doc. S/RES/242	83
	https://undocs.org/S/RES/242(1967)	
59.	Eugene W. Rostow, "Are the settlements legal? Resolved" <i>The New Republic</i> (21 October 1991)	85
	http://maurice-ostroff.tripod.com/id45.html	
60.	Hashemite Jordan Kingdom-Israel General Armistice Agreement, 3 April 1949, 42 U.N.T.S. 303	86
	https://peacemaker.un.org/sites/peacemaker.un.org/files/IL%20JO_490403_Hashemite%20Jordan%20Kingdom- Israel%20General%20Armistice%20Agreement.pdf	
61.	UNGA Res. 181 (II), 29 November 1947, UN Doc. A/RES/181(II)	90
	https://undocs.org/A/RES/181(II)	
62.	Relocation of the United States Embassy to Jerusalem (Palestine v. United States of America), Application Instituting Proceedings, 28 September 2018	91
	$\frac{https://www.icj-cij.org/files/case-related/176/176-20180928-APP-01-00-EN.pdf}{$	
63.	Prosecution's Request for a Ruling on Jurisdiction under Article 19(3) of the Statute, Application Under Regulation 46(3), 9 April 2018, ICC-RoC46(3)-01/18-1	94
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/CourtRecords/CR2018_02057.PDF	
64.	Lighthouses Case between France and Greece (France v. Greece), 1934 P.C.I.J. (ser. A/B) No. 62 (Mar. 17)	95
	http://www.worldcourts.com/pcij/eng/decisions/1934.03.17_lighthouses.htm	
65.	Michael A. Newton, "How the International Criminal Court Threatens Treaty Norms" (2016) 49 Vand. J. Transnat'l L. 371	95, 96, 97
	(Article attached)	
66.	Roger O'Keefe, "Universal Jurisdiction: Clarifying the Basic Concept" (2004) 2 J. Int'l. Crim. J. 735	98, 99
	(Article attached)	
67.	Judgment on the appeal against the decision on the authorisation of an investigation into the situation in the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Appeals Chamber, ICC-02/17-138, 5 March 2020	104
	https://www.icc-cpi.int/Pages/record.aspx?docNo=ICC-02/17-138	