Cour Pénale Internationale





Original: French No.: ICC-01/12-01/18

Date: 1 July 2019

## PRE-TRIAL CHAMBER I

Before: Judge Péter Kovács, Single Judge

## SITUATION IN THE REPUBLIC OF MALI

IN THE CASE OF THE PROSECUTOR v. AL HASSAN AG ABDOUL AZIZ AG MOHAMED AG MAHMOUD

# PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

With confidential ANNEX A

**Decision on Participation of Victims in the Proceedings** 

Decision to be notified in accordance with regulation 31 of the Regulations of the Court to:

Office of the Prosecutor

Counsel for the Defence Ms Fatou Bensouda Ms Melinda Taylor

Mr James Stewart

Ms Marie-Hélène Proulx

**Legal Representatives of Victims** 

Mr Seydou Doumbia Mr Mayombo Kassongo Mr Fidel Luvengika Nsita **Legal Representatives of Applicants** 

**Unrepresented Victims Unrepresented Applicants for** 

Participation/Reparations

Office of Public Counsel for the States' Representatives

Defence

**REGISTRY** 

Registrar **Counsel Support Section** 

Mr Peter Lewis

**Victims and Witnesses Section Detention Section** 

Victims Participation and

**Reparations Section** Other

Mr Philipp Ambach

Judge **Péter Kovács**, designated by Pre-Trial Chamber I ("Chamber") of the International Criminal Court ("Court") as Single Judge responsible for carrying out the functions of the Chamber in the case of *The Prosecutor v. Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud* ("Al Hassan case") as of 28 March 2018, decides the following.

### I. Procedural history

- 1. On 27 March 2018, pursuant to article 58 of the Rome Statute ("Statute"), the Chamber issued a warrant of arrest for Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud ("Mr Al Hassan").<sup>2</sup>
- 2. On 31 March 2018, Mr Al Hassan was surrendered to the Court; he is currently in custody at its detention centre in The Hague.<sup>3</sup>
- 3. On 3 April 2018, the Single Judge set the first appearance for 4 April 2018.<sup>4</sup>
- 4. On 4 April 2018, the first appearance hearing was held; the Single Judge set the confirmation hearing to start on Monday, 24 September 2018.<sup>5</sup>
- 5. On 24 May 2018, the Single Judge issued his first decision establishing the principles applicable to victims' applications for participation ("Decision of 24 May 2018"),6 in which he *inter alia* directed the Registry to classify the applicants into three categories: "(a) applicants who clearly qualify as victims ('Group A'); (b) applicants who clearly do not qualify as victims ('Group B'); and (c) applicants for whom the Registry could not make a clear determination for any reason ('Group C')".<sup>7</sup> The Single Judge also directed the Registry to (i) transmit all complete applications to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Decision Designating a Single Judge", dated 28 March 2018 and reclassified as public on 31 March 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-6-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Warrant of Arrest for Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud", dated 27 March 2018 and reclassified as public on 31 March 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-2-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ICC-01/12-01/18-11-US-Exp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Order Scheduling the First Appearance of Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud", 3 April 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-12-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Transcript of the first appearance hearing, 4 April 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-T-1-Red-FRA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "Decision Establishing the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation", 24 May 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-37-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 59(i).

the Chamber and all Group C applications to the parties, and submit regular reports listing the applications for participation classified according to the three groups, as well as assessment reports highlighting the difficulties encountered regarding the Group C applications;<sup>8</sup> and (ii) submit observations concerning the implementation of outreach activities,<sup>9</sup> the matter of a form for collective applications and, in particular, the victims' willingness to form groups,<sup>10</sup> and the legal representation of victims.<sup>11</sup>

- 6. On 20 July 2018, the Single Judge postponed the confirmation hearing to 6 May 2019.<sup>12</sup>
- 7. On 23 July 2018, the Registry filed a first report on the legal representation of victims ("Registry's First Report on Legal Representation" or "First Report on Legal Representation"). The Prosecutor and the Defence did not file observations on the report.
- 8. On 27 July 2018, the Registry submitted a joint report on outreach and other victim-related issues ("Registry's Joint Report on Outreach"),<sup>14</sup> in which the Victims Participation and Reparations Section ("VPRS") sought additional time to continue its activities in the field, proposing to collect more information for the submission of a further report.<sup>15</sup> The Prosecutor and the Defence did not submit observations in response.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, paras. 69-70.

 $<sup>^{12}</sup>$  "Decision Postponing the Date of the Confirmation Hearing", 20 July 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-94-Conf-Exp-tENG. On the same day, the Single Judge issued a public redacted version of his decision, ICC-01/12-01/18-94-Red-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> "Registry's Report on Legal Representation of Victims", 23 July 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-98, with two annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-98-Conf-Exp-AnxI and ICC-01/12-01/18-98-Conf-Exp-AnxII. On 9 August 2018, the Registry filed a public redacted version of Annex I to the Registry's First Report on Legal Representation, ICC-01/12-01/18-98-AnxI-Red

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> "Registry's Joint Report on Outreach and Other Victim Related Issues", 27 July 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-102, with an annex classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-102-Conf-Exp-Anx. On 9 August 2018, the Registry filed a public redacted version of the annex to the Registry's Joint Report on Outreach, ICC-01/12-01/18-102-Anx-Red.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Registry's Joint Report on Outreach, paras. 39-40.

- 9. On 11 September 2018, the Single Judge issued his "Decision on the Registry's Reports concerning Victim Participation", <sup>16</sup> in which he authorized the Registry to submit an additional report by 19 December 2018, with a view to ruling on the adoption of a form for collective applications<sup>17</sup> and on the legal representation of victims, and sought further information from the Registry, including as to whether common legal representation of the victims would be suitable, and as to an estimate of the funds which the Registry might be in a position to allocate under the head of legal assistance in the case ("Decision of 11 September 2018"). <sup>18</sup>
- 10. On 17 September 2018, the Registry filed a first report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group  $A^{19}$  and a first report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group  $C^{20}$
- 11. On the same day, the Registry filed a first assessment report on the victims' applications for participation, giving information on the approach taken to Group A applications and the difficulties encountered in assessing Group C applications ("Registry's First Assessment Report" or "First Assessment Report").<sup>21</sup> The Prosecutor and the Defence did not file observations on the report.
- 12. On 8 October 2018, the Single Judge rendered his "Second Decision on the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation",<sup>22</sup> (i) authorizing VPRS to treat as falling within the time frame of the case any application which, while not providing a specific date, gives information on the general context from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "Decision on the Registry's Reports concerning Victim Participation", 11 September 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-119-Red-tENG, with a confidential version *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-119-Conf-Exp-tENG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Decision on the Registry's Reports concerning Victim Participation, para. 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Decision on the Registry's Reports concerning Victim Participation, paras. 21 and 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> "Registry's First Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 17 September 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-127, with 20 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> "Registry's First Transmission of Group C Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 17 September 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-128, with 14 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, and redacted versions thereof.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "Registry's First Assessment Report on Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 17 September 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-126, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-126-Conf-AnxA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> "Second Decision on the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation", 8 October 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-146-tENG.

which it may be inferred that the application falls within the time frame;<sup>23</sup> (ii) laying down the criteria under which applications that describe any form of underlying act constituting the crime of persecution can be entertained;<sup>24</sup> and (iii) authorizing VPRS to treat as victims of psychological harm persons who witnessed crimes committed against other members of the population of Timbuktu, provided they give a detailed description of the events and proof of residence in Timbuktu ("Decision of 8 October 2018").<sup>25</sup>

- 13. On 6 November 2018, the Registry filed a second report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A.<sup>26</sup>
- 14. On the same day, the Registry filed a second assessment report on the victims' applications for participation ("Registry's Second Assessment Report" or "Second Assessment Report". The Prosecutor and the Defence did not submit observations in response.
- 15. On 19 December 2018, the Registry filed a second report on legal representation of the victims ("Registry's Second Report on Legal Representation"). <sup>28</sup> The Prosecutor and the Defence did not file observations on the report.
- 16. On the same day, the Registry filed a second report on the use of a form for collective applications ("Registry's Second Report on the Use of a Form for Collective

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Second Decision on the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation, paras. 22, 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Second Decision on the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation, para. 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Second Decision on the Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation, paras. 35-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> "Registry's Second Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 6 November 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-175, with 74 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Registry's Second Assessment Report on Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 6 November 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-176, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-176-Conf-Anx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> "Registry's Second Report on Legal Representation of Victims", 19 December 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-209, with three annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-209-Conf-Exp-AnxII, ICC-01/12-01/18-209-Conf-Exp-AnxIII and ICC-01/12-01/18-209-Conf-Exp-AnxIII. On 25 January 2019, the Registry filed a public redacted version of Annex I to the Second Report on Legal Representation, ICC-01/12-01/18-209-AnxI-Red.

Applications").<sup>29</sup> The Prosecutor and the Defence did not file observations on the report.

- 17. On 25 January 2019, the Registry filed a second report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group  $C^{30}$  and a third report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group  $A^{31}$
- 18. On the same day, the Registry filed a third assessment report on victims' applications for participation ("Registry's Third Assessment Report" or "Third Assessment Report"),<sup>32</sup> in which, to enable it to reach a determination on certain victims' applications for participation, it sought the Single Judge's views regarding, in particular, the geographic scope of the case<sup>33</sup> and the recognition of the *locus standi* of direct victim on the basis of the attacks against religious buildings and historical monuments.<sup>34</sup> The Prosecutor and the Defence did not file observations on the report.
- 19. On 12 February 2019, the Single Judge issued an order directing submissions from the Prosecutor on the geographic scope of the case ("Order of 12 February 2019").<sup>35</sup>

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> "Registry's Second Report on the use of Collective Application Forms", 19 December 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18210, with an annex classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-210-Conf-Exp-Anx. On 11 March 2019, the Registry filed a public redacted version of the annex to the Second Report on the Use of a Form for Collective Applications, ICC-01/12-01/18-210-Anx-Red.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "Registry's Second Transmission of Group C Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 25 January 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-228, with 15 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry, and confidential redacted versions thereof.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> "Registry's Third Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 25 January 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-227, with 83 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> "Registry's Third Assessment Report on Victim's Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 25 January 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-226, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-226-Conf-AnxA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Registry's Third Assessment Report, para. 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Registry's Third Assessment Report, para. 21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> "Ordonnance sollicitant des observations du Procureur sur l'étendue géographique de la présente affaire", ICC-01/12-01/18-242.

- 20. On that day, the Registry filed a fourth report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A<sup>36</sup> and a fourth assessment report on victims' applications for participation.<sup>37</sup>
- 21. On 19 February 2019, the Prosecutor filed her submissions in accordance with the Order of 12 February 2019.<sup>38</sup>
- 22. On 18 March 2019, the Registry filed a fifth report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A <sup>39</sup> and a fifth assessment report on victims' applications for participation. <sup>40</sup>
- 23. On 20 March 2019, the Single Judge issued his "Decision on Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation, to Legal Representation of Victims, and to the Manner of Victim Participation in the Proceedings" ("Decision of 20 March 2019"),<sup>41</sup> in which he provided VPRS with guidance to enable it to reach a determination on a number of victims' applications for participation.
- 24. On 8 April 2019, the Registry filed a sixth report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A, a first report transmitting applications for

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> "Registry's Fourth Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 12 February 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-244, with 80 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

 $<sup>^{37}</sup>$  "Registry's Fourth Assessment Report on Victim's Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 12 February 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-245, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-245-Conf-Anx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> "Observations du Bureau du Procureur suivant l'Ordonnance sollicitant des observations du Procureur sur l'étendue géographique de la présente affaire", ICC-01/12-01/18-249, para. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> "Registry's Fifth Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 18 March 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-282, with 163 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> "Registry's Fifth Assessment Report on Victim's Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings, 18 March 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-281, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-281-Conf-Anx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> "Decision on Principles Applicable to Victims' Applications for Participation, to Legal Representation of Victims, and to the Manner of Victim Participation in the Proceedings", 20 March 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-289-Conf-Exp-tENG-Corr. On the same day, the Single Judge issued a public redacted version of his decision, ICC-01/12-01/18-289-Red.

participation from victims in Group B42 and a sixth assessment report on victims' applications for participation.<sup>43</sup>

- 25. On 18 April 2019, the Single Judge issued a decision directing the Prosecutor to file the DCC by Wednesday, 8 May 2019 and rescheduling the confirmation hearing for Monday, 8 July 2019.44
- 26. On that day, the Registry filed a seventh report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A, a second report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group B45 and a seventh assessment report on the victims' applications for participation.<sup>46</sup>
- 27. On 8 May 2019, the Prosecutor filed the document containing the charges ("DCC") against Mr Al Hassan.47
- 28. On 11 May 2019, the Prosecutor filed an amended and corrected version of the DCC against Mr Al Hassan.<sup>48</sup>
- 29. On 31 May 2019, the Registry filed a report pursuant to the Decision of 20 March 2019.49
- 30. On 7 June 2019, the Prosecutor filed the DCC in Arabic.<sup>50</sup>

<sup>42 &</sup>quot;Registry's Sixth Transmission of Group A Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings and the First Transmission of Group B Victims' Applications", 8 April 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-306, with 76 annexes classified as confidential ex parte, only available to the Registry.

<sup>43 &</sup>quot;Registry's Sixth Assessment Report on Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 8 April 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-305, with Annex A classified as confidential, ICC-01/12-01/18-305-Conf-AnxA, and Annex B classified as confidential ex parte, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-305-Conf-Exp-AnxB.

<sup>44 &</sup>quot;Decision Rescheduling the Date of Filing of the Document Containing the Charges and the Commencement of the Confirmation Hearing", ICC-01/12-01/18-313-tENG, paras. 18-20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> "Registry's Seventh Transmission of Group A Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings and the Second Transmission of Group B Victims' Applications", 18 April 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-311, with 311 annexes classified as confidential ex parte, only available to the Registry.

<sup>46 &</sup>quot;Registry's Seventh Assessment Report on Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 18 April 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-312, with Annex A classified as confidential, ICC-01/12-01/18-312-Conf-AnxA, and Annex B classified as confidential ex parte, only available to the Registry, ICC-01/12-01/18-312-Conf-Exp-AnxB.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> ICC-01/12-01/18-335-Conf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> ICC-01/12-01/18-335-Conf-Corr.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> "Rapport du Greffe en application de la Décision du 20 mars 2019", 31 May 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-359.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> ICC-01/12-01/18-366.

- 31. On 11 June 2019, the Prosecutor filed the Arabic version of the DCC containing the footnotes.<sup>51</sup>
- 32. On 24 June 2019, the Registry filed an eighth report transmitting applications for participation from victims in Group A<sup>52</sup> and an eighth assessment report on the victims' applications for participation.<sup>53</sup>

# II. Applicable law

- 33. The Single Judge refers to articles 21, 57(3)(c) and 68 of the Statute, rules 85-89 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence ("Rules"), regulation 86 of the Regulations of the Court and regulations 107-109 of the Regulations of the Registry.
- 34. The Single Judge also refers to the Decision of 24 May 2018,<sup>54</sup> the Decision of 8 October 2018<sup>55</sup> and the Decision of 20 March 2019,<sup>56</sup> which set out the applicable law and previous rulings on the criteria which, on the basis of a *prima facie* assessment, applicants must fulfil in order to be granted the *locus standi* to participate in the proceedings as a victim.
- 35. The Single Judge notes in particular that persons seeking to be admitted to participate as victims in the proceedings must show that they are victims within the meaning of rule 85 of the Rules, and must therefore meet the following criteria:
  - i. their identities as natural persons must be established;
  - ii. they have suffered harm; and
  - iii. the harm suffered is the result of an incident falling within the temporal, geographic and material parameters of the case.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> ICC-01/12-01/18-370.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> "Registry's Eighth Transmission of Group A Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 24 June 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-384, with 62 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> "Registry's Eighth Assessment Report on Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 24 June 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-383, with confidential annex ICC-01/12-01/18-383-Conf-Anx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, paras. 46, 48-54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Decision of 8 October 2018, paras. 19-24, 27-30, 33-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Decision of 20 March 2019, paras. 55-61, 64-67.

### III. Determination of the Single Judge

36. Under the system of admission put in place by the Decision of 24 May 2018,<sup>57</sup> the Registry has transmitted, in eight batches, a total of 890 applications for participation. In the present decision, the Single Judge will first rule on the *locus standi* of the applicants in Groups A and B and will then determine, having regard to the observations of the parties, whether the Group C applications transmitted to him fulfil the conditions required for the *locus standi* of victim to be accorded in the case.

### A. Group A and B applications

- 37. The Registry has transmitted to the Chamber a total of 882 applications from Group A and 5 applications from Group B, having made an initial assessment of each application and determined either that it clearly fulfils or clearly does not fulfil the above-stated conditions required for the applicants to be accorded the *locus standi* of victim within the meaning of rule 85(a) of the Rules.
- 38. The Single Judge has not detected any error in the Registry's assessment and therefore (i) authorizes the participation of the 882 applicants whose applications were transmitted to him as falling within Group A; and (ii) orders that the *locus standi* of victim not be accorded to Applicants [REDACTED], whose applications are classified in Group B. This is because the events described by those applicants [REDACTED].<sup>58</sup>
- 39. Regarding Applicant [REDACTED], however, whose application is classified in Group B, the Single Judge sees that VPRS concluded that the application [REDACTED].<sup>59</sup>
- 40. In the first place, the Single Judge would underscore that the assessment of victim admissibility is distinct from any assessment of the facts and circumstances described in the charges, and is based on a *prima facie* analysis. Accordingly, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 59.

<sup>58 [</sup>REDACTED].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> [REDACTED].

Single Judge recalls that applications for participation are to be assessed against the *prima facie* standard of proof, as stated in the Decision of 24 May 2018,<sup>60</sup> the Decision of 8 October 2018<sup>61</sup> and the Decision of 20 March 2019.<sup>62</sup>

- 41. Here, the Single Judge is of the view that persecution on religious grounds may have taken the form of acts other than those enumerated in the DCC,<sup>63</sup> and it is his opinion that, at this stage, the nexus required between the harm suffered and the incident falling within the scope of the case must, as regards the crime of persecution, be interpreted broadly.
- 42. The Single Judge therefore considers it appropriate to seek further information from Applicant [REDACTED] [REDACTED]. The Single Judge accordingly directs the Registry to request, with due regard for the applicant's safety, further information from Applicant [REDACTED].
- 43. Lastly, the Single Judge would underscore that, should a similar situation arise in future in respect of alleged victims of the crime of persecution, the Registry is to proceed in the same manner.

### B. Group C applications

44. In the First Assessment Report and the Third Assessment Report, the Registry stated that it had not been able to make a clear determination as to whether the information provided by 29 applicants was sufficient to establish that the third criterion under rule 85(a) of the Rules was satisfied.<sup>64</sup> In other words, the Registry identified and transmitted to the Chamber and the parties 29 applications which it classified in Group C, as it could not clearly say whether the personal harm alleged by the applicants was the result of an incident falling within the temporal, geographic and material parameters of the case.

-

<sup>60</sup> Decision of 24 May 2018, para. 48.

<sup>61</sup> Decision of 8 October 2018, para. 20.

<sup>62</sup> Decision of 20 March 2019, para. 58.

<sup>63 [</sup>REDACTED].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Registry's First Assessment Report, para. 16; Registry's Third Assessment Report, para. 15.

- 45. However, after the clarifications provided by the Single Judge in the Decision of 8 October 2018<sup>65</sup> and the Decision of 20 March 2019,<sup>66</sup> VPRS reviewed some of the applications originally classified in Group C. Thus the Single Judge notes that, in the batches of 6 November 2018<sup>67</sup>, 8 April 2019<sup>68</sup> and 24 June 2019<sup>69</sup> of Group A applications for participation, VPRS reclassified in Group A most of the applications for participation that had originally been classified in Group C. As a result, the Single Judge sees that only three applications for participation remain classified in Group C.
- 46. That notwithstanding, the Single Judge notes that he is informed by VPRS that, following the clarifications he provided in the above-mentioned decisions, further particulars have been requested from the three applicants in question, so as to enable VPRS to consider their applications for participation in greater detail.<sup>70</sup> The Single Judge sees, however, that VPRS has not yet received answers to its requests.<sup>71</sup> In the light of those considerations, the Single Judge is of the view that his ruling on those applications for participation must be deferred until the Registry is able to reach a determination on them or provides the Chamber with further particulars.

No. ICC-01/12-01/18

<sup>65</sup> Decision of 8 October 2018, paras. 19-24, 27-30, 33-37.

<sup>66</sup> Decision of 20 March 2019, paras. 55-61, 64-67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> "Registry's Second Transmission of Group A Applications for Victims' Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 6 November 2018, ICC-01/12-01/18-175, with 74 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> "Registry's Sixth Transmission of Group A Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings and the First Transmission of Group B Victims' Applications", 8 April 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-306, with 76 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> "Registry's Eighth Transmission of Group A Victims' Applications for Participation in Pre-Trial Proceedings", 24 June 2019, ICC-01/12-01/18-384, with 62 annexes classified as confidential *ex parte*, only available to the Registry.

 $<sup>^{70}</sup>$  Email from VPRS to the Chamber on 27 May 2019 at 16.51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Email from VPRS to the Chamber on 27 May 2019 at 16.51.

FOR THESE REASONS, the Single Judge

**DECIDES** to recognize the *locus standi* of the applicants listed in Annex A to

participate as victims;

**DECIDES** to reject the applications for participation from Applicants [REDACTED];

**DIRECTS** the Registry to request further information from Applicant [REDACTED];

**DIRECTS** the Registry to transmit to the legal representatives of victims, in redacted

and unredacted form, the applications for participation from the participating

victims listed in Annex A;

**DEFERS HIS DECISION** on the remainder of the applications for participation which

the Registry has, for the time being, classified in Group C.

Done in both English and French, the French version being authoritative.

[signed]

Judge Péter Kovács

Single Judge

Dated this 1 July 2019

At The Hague, Netherlands